



Which Book Do You Use, “Bahasa Inggris” by Kemendikbud or “Pathway to English” by Erlangga? : A Content Analysis

Agustina Septua Sapta Sihotang¹, Sondang Manik², Arsen Nahum Pasaribu³
sihagustina@gmail.com, sondang.manik@uhn.ac.id, arsen.pasaribu@uhn.ac.id

¹²³Univeritas HKBP Nommensen, Medan, Indonesia

Received: 25 November 2021 Accepted: 14 December 2021
DOI: 10.24256/ideas.v9i2.2320

Abstract

This research was conducted to find out the quality of two textbooks, “Bahasa Inggris” by Kemendikbud and “Pathway to English” by Erlangga for tenth grade based on the theory of Cunnings Sworth. The approach applied in this study was qualitative descriptive approach. In collecting and analyzing the data, the researcher used 7 out of 8 categories that consist of 40 checklist criteria to find out the result of this research. The data source was entered into checklist table to compare the materials in both books. The researcher then reported the table's results in terms of the aims and objectives, design and organization, linguistic content, skills, topic, methodology, and practical considerations. The writer found that both are good books and suitable for teachers and learners in Indonesia. “Bahasa Inggris” has met 80% fulfillment percentage of the checklist criteria and “Pathway to English” has met 87% fulfillment percentage. Both have weaknesses as well as strengths. This research can be beneficial for teachers to gain information about the quality and suitability of a textbook for learners and teachers so that teachers can decide which book is going to be used in the class. It is also beneficial to writers to improve the book, to publishers to know which book is good to publish and also to understand the definition of an excellent book. And the last, it is also useful to help other researchers to do the next research and to give information on how to do content analysis research.

Keywords: Content analysis; Cunnings worth Theory; Content Quality; Textbook; Tenth Grade

Introduction

A textbook is a book that serves both as a standard form of information for the formal study of a subject and a teaching and learning tool. (Graves, 2000). Teacher needs textbook to help them organizing the lesson material given to students. While students need it to understand the material given by teachers. The

usage of textbooks has merits and demerits; what one teacher sees as a value in a textbook, another may see as a disadvantage.(Graves, 2000). According to Richards, a program seems to have little influence without textbooks; consequently, they provide structure and a syllabus. (Richards, 2010). Textbook consists of set of visuals, activities, reading, etc so that teachers would be able to plan and develop their instructional materials in less time. A textbook that has assessment tools helps teacher to evaluate the students' progress. Thus, the used of the same textbook in the same level can keep the lessons having similar content in the same level. The used of the same series of textbooks in different levels also give consistency between levels. Meanwhile, a textbook helps students to understand the topic and the aim of the lesson. They have the guideline of the lesson so they can anticipate the topic and know what to be expected from them. Beside of those advantages, the use of textbook also has disadvantages. First, a teacher might rely on the textbook only. So, teacher doesn't try to use supplementary materials or teaching aids in the teaching-learning process. While according to Graves (Graves, 2000) teacher should be able to revise, modify, assess, change, eliminate, or add to the book's materials at any time. Then, a textbook is usually created based on the author's social and culture. Since most books are used for the international market, the samples in the book usually based on the author's social and culture so that sometimes they are not in accordance the needs of the learners, and the language used in the book may not be at the appropriate level. Because of these factors, it may fail to pique students' interest, and they may struggle to comprehend the lesson. Whereas teachers have the responsibility in choosing the appropriate books so that they must be able to give a judgment about textbooks.

Thus, by selecting a suitable textbook, teachers can give the lessons and activities that students require, while also saving time for the teacher to prepare for the lesson..A good textbook not only helps students become more interested in learning the lesson, but it also allows them to build their fluency in the target language. As a result, the researcher opts for a textbook analysis because not all teachers are aware of the characteristics of a good textbook and how to select the appropriate book for use in the classroom. Sheldon mentions two basic reasons to evaluate a course book :1) The evaluation will assist the teacher in coming to a decision on the course book to be using. 2) Analyzing the benefits and implications of a coursebook will inform teachers about its potential weaknesses and strengths.(Sheldon, 1988).

Experts have presented some hypotheses for determining if a book is a good textbook. Some experts recommend using a checklist to do the review. According to Mukundan et al.(Mukundan& Nimehchisalem, 2012) a checklist provides a more specific evaluation than a set of generic evaluative criteria. In keeping with the statement Cunningsworth, whose work on EFL/ESL textbook evaluation is widely recognized as one of the most significant, offered evaluation checklist criteria. He divided the general textbook rating criteria into eight categories and created a checklist with 45 items. He categorizes them into eight groups: 1) objectives and methods, 2) layout/organization, 3) content of the language, 4) study skills, 5) topic, 6) methodology, 7) book for teachers and 8) practical aspects.

A number of recent studies have attempted to assess the quality of English textbooks used in classrooms. The first study was from Apriyani, Lia A. and,

Robiasih, Rr. Hasti (Apriyani & Robiasih, 2019). Cunningsworth's hypothesis was used in their essay titled "Eight Grade Text Book Evaluation." The object of this research was "When English Rings a Bell" and "Bright" for junior high school in the eighth grade. The aims of the study are to discover whether the two books are good books based on Cunningsworth's checklist, and to find the books' advantages and limitations. Although they can not fulfill all of the criteria both books are considered as good textbooks. An Analysis of the English Textbook Entitled "Bahasa Inggris SMA/MASMK/MAK Kelas X" was also undertaken by Safitri (Tyas & Safitri, 2019). Biocchi's coursebook evaluation was employed in this study by conducting open-ended interview. The findings show that this textbook is well-designed and meets Biocchi's coursebook standards. The book's disadvantage is that it does not come with a recorded audio for the listening activity, therefore educators will be responsible for providing their own recordings.

Despite the fact that various research on textbook evaluation have been performed, there has been no analysis utilizing Cunningsworth's theory to compare English textbooks "Bahasa Inggris" by Kemendikbud and "Pathway to English" by Erlangga for tenth grade. More importantly, considering that the textbooks chosen are utilized by almost all secondary school instructors, it is necessary to assess its quality so that the English teacher can determine whether or not to modify it.

By formulating the research problem, the researchers conducted a study to determine the quality of Kemendikbud's "Bahasa Inggris" and Erlangga's "Pathway to English" for tenth grade, as well as the use of Cunningsworth's (Cunningsworth, 1995) coursebook evaluation checklist.

Method

This is a case study that explores into the details of two tenth-grade textbooks, "Bahasa Inggris" by Kemendikbud and "Pathway to English" by Erlangga, as well as performing a document analysis utilizing Cunningsworth's quick-reference checklist (Cunningsworth, 1995). The coursebook evaluation checklist divided into seven categories with a 40-question checklist. They were aims and approaches, design and organization, language content, skills, topic, methodology, and practical consideration.

The first point is about the coursebook's goals and objectives, which include whether the coursebook's goals are closely aligned with the teaching program and with the needs of the students, and whether the goals are acceptable for the learning-teaching environment, the comprehensiveness and the flexibility of the books and the learning styles. The second point is about design and organization which discusses about the book packages, how the content organized, how the sequence of the content is, the grading appropriateness, the layout of the book, availability of reference sections grammar and whether the material suitable for individual study. The third point is talking about language content includes the appropriateness of grammar, the adequacy and range of vocabulary quantity, the availability of pronunciation work, above-sentence language organization and standards, as well as the matching of word choice to social environment. The fourth point encircles the skills which discussing the four skills listening, speaking, reading and writing integratedly, the appropriateness of reading text with the student's level, the availability of a well recorded material, whether the content for

spoken English (dialogues, roleplays, etc.) is well-designed to equip students for real-life conversations, and whether the level of supervision in writing exercises is suitable. The fifth point is talking about topic which seeks the answer for the questions about the adequacy of the topic's diversity and range, as well as the topic's quality, whether the topic can help students broaden and enrich their experience; whether the topics are sophisticated enough in content while still being within the learners' language level; whether students will be able to relate to the social and cultural contexts presented in the books; and whether women and men are treated equally in the topics. The next point is methodology which looked at the coursebook's approach to language and the appropriateness for learning and teaching, the appropriateness of the coursebooks with the students' learning styles, variety of skills taught and students' learning strategies. The last point is discussing about the price, whether it was affordable and valuable, the arrangement of the books, the aesthetics of the cover and pages, the books' durability and the usable and availability of the equipment needed.

In order to draw appropriate interpretation, there were five steps done in conducting the research. The first step is identifying and collecting the data. Then after collecting the data the next step is determining the coding categories. A code is a term that is used to identify the text to be studied. The researchers utilized a simple tick and cross technique on the table checklist to grade both textbooks. It was carried out to ascertain the textbook's quality using checklist criteria and cross-checker data from the checklist evaluation. The fourth step is by checking the validity and the reliability of the content. The last step is by analyzing and writing the report result. Several sets of information will be organized and available as files once the analysis is completed. This must be presented in a reader-friendly report manner.

Results

This textbook evaluation sought to determine whether the "Bahasa Inggris" textbook by Kemendikbud and Erlangga "Pathway to English" textbook for tenth graders fulfill Cunningsworth's criteria for good textbooks. The findings of the research showed that both books have been analyzed statistically and the tabulating of data. The data is calculated in a precise way to determine the existence or absence of the criterion.

$$\text{Percentage} = \frac{\sum X}{N} \times 100\%$$

$\sum X$ = the total of criteria points which were met in the evaluation checklist.

N = the total of criteria points in each category.

The total of the scores was supposed to be 100 percent, and this condition was utilized to determine the data analysis outcome. The calculation was given on both textbooks with the same condition and similar formulation. The range and statement are as suggested by Pusat Perbukuan (Pusbuk, 2000) are as follows :

Table 1 Range and Statement

Range	Statement
80 % - 100 %	Good
60 % - 79 %	Fair
50% - 59%	Sufficient
Below 50%	Poor

After closely scrutinized all criteria in all units in "Bahasa Inggris" then will be assign as Textbook 1 (T1), all points made by reviewer as for and against a particular textbook were jotted down in the form of table. Then, using the same technique, the things that checklist creators introduce as key criteria in "Pathway to English" then will be names as Textbook 2 (T2) were identified. The premise was that, out of all the issues raised, a core set of common-core summary features that appeared in all of the evaluations and checklists could be identified as universal

Data Analysis

In this part, the researcher uses a checklist table to indicate the total score for each category requirement. The researcher presents the data in the tables and calculates the score by using the formulation presented before.

1) Aims and objectives

Both books were rated in this category based on their relevance, applicability of the coursebook to the learning-teaching context, thoroughness, and flexibility in accommodating various teaching and learning styles. The writer evaluated goals and approaches by connecting textbook learning objectives to the 2013 Curricullum's core competency whether they are appropriate or not and compared the verbs (the actions) that were used on the objectives in detail to Bloom's Taxonomy Verbs (Blooms, 1956). Furthermore, the techniques could be assessed by looking at the content of the textbook to see if it covers what teachers and students required.

Table 2 Aims and Objectives

NO	Checklist Criteria	T1	T2
I	Aims and Objectives		
	1. The coursebook's objectives are very relevant to the objectives of the educational program as well as the interests of the students.	1	1
	2. The coursebook's applicability for the learning/teaching circumstances.	1	1
	3.Thecoursebook is thorough, covering the majority (if not all) of what is required, and providing useful resources for students.	1	1
	4.Thecoursebook's versatility, which allows for a variety of teaching and learning styles.	1	1
Total		4	4
Percentage		100%	100%

The table 2 indicates that both textbooks have fulfilled all of the criteria (100%) which made them considered as good books in terms of aims and objectives. It showed that the books' aims and objectives have met the aims of the teaching program because they already met the basic competences based on some assumptions about language function. One of the basic competences in Curriculum 2013 syllabus is that English is needed in students' daily life and the aims and objectives of those books try to cover the daily life of English topics. It indicates that the books are appropriate to the learning-teaching situation, comprehensive so they are useful resources for both teachers and students and also flexible which allows different teaching and learning styles.

Unlike T2, T1 provides the aims and objectives of the chapters but they are not specific elaborated. The sentences used are conceptual and too complex so they are not relevant for teens. So, this might lead to misconception. Students cannot make their personal objectives because they do not understand what they learn and what they are expected to achieve. This can make them fail to absorb the lesson, to give feedback to each other and unable to do a self reflection because they do not know the purpose of the lesson clearly.

Meanwhile the objectives in T2 are clear and specific by applying the Blooms Taxonomy Verbs (Blooms, 1956) in the lesson objectives which are developed from Low Order Thinking to High Order Thinking (Blooms, 1956). In order to achieve High Order Thinking skills students must be able to master Low Order Thinking skills so they are prepared to the real life situation.

2) Design and Organization

This section evaluated the components package, sufficient content structure, content sequencing, proper grading and progression, adequate recycling and revision, grammatical reference, and book layout.

Table 3 Design and Organization

NO	Checklist Criteria	T1	T2
II	Design and Organization		
	1. The components of the package (CD, Audio, Teachers' book, workbook)	1	1
	2. The appropriateness of content organization to the learners and teachers needs.	1	1
	3. Is the content organized (e.g., by complexity, "learnability," utility, and so on)?	1	1
	4. The learners' ability to finish the work required to meet any external syllabus criteria is determined by the appropriateness of grading and progression.	1	1
	5. Recycle and revise as needed.	1	1
	6. Provide grammar reference and Individual study	1	1
	7. The layout is clear and easy to navigate your way around throughout the book.	1	1
Total	7	7	
Percentage	100 %	100%	

Table 3 indicates that both books have fulfilled all of the checklist criteria in this category. The difference is that T1 does not provide CD and audio. Unlike T1, T2 provides listening audio that can be accessed by scanning the QR code that are available in the book on each listening part. The audience of the books is teenagers so T1 and T2 provides visuals or pictures to start the lesson. The differences of these two books are, T2 provides more pictures than T1. T2 provides picture dictionaries for the vocabulary words in each unit, on the other hands T1 provide only one or two pictures in each unit and there is not any picture dictionaries at all.

3) Language Content

This criterion seeks to answer the questions whether the grammar appropriates for each level, the quantity and the range of the vocabulary is adequate, whether the pronunciation work is available (word stress, sentence stress, individual words, intonation and et cetera). It tries to determine whether the books' structure and use of language extend beyond the level of a single sentence, for example, how to construct sentences, participate in dialogues, structure a piece of prolonged writing, and identify key themes in reading passage. It also aims to find an answer to the question of whether the language style is appropriate in a social situation.

Table 4 Language Content

NO	Checklist Criteria	T1	T2
III	Language Content		
	1. The coursebook covers the most important grammar points for each level, while also taking into account the demands of the students.	1	1
	2. The suitability of vocabulary teaching materials in terms of quantity and variety of word, the emphasis on vocabulary development, and individual learning methodologies.	1	1
	3. Pronunciation exercises are shown in the coursebook (individual sounds, word stress, sentence stress, intonation.)	0	1
	4. The coursebook covers the structure and rules of language use above the level of sentences, for example. How to participate in a discussion, plan a long written text, or recognize the key topics in a reading passage?(This is particularly important at the intermediate and advanced levels.)	1	1
	5. Language style that corresponded to/was appropriate for the social environment.	0	0
	Total	3	4
	Percentage	60 %	80%

Based on table 4 both textbooks have not met all the checklist criteria. Textbook 1 (T1) only gained 60% fulfillment and Textbook 2 (T2) achieved 80% checklist criteria fulfillment.

It is important for a coursebook to meet the learners' needs by providing material that implemented the objectives. An English textbook should include three elements to support the teaching-learning process: a single thing to be learnt,

explanations or contextualized examples to help learners understand how the language works/is used, and exercises. In this case in each chapter T1 and T2 only provide one grammar topic to be learned and then followed with explanation and samples that also can be found in each chapter to support learner to understand language. Then each chapter also incorporates exercises after giving the material and examples. Therefore, T1 and T2 have met the criteria of the first language content criteria.

The target vocabulary might be introduced in a number of different ways. Such as detailed description (aspects, traits, etc.); Hyponyms (examples); Illustration (image, object); demonstration (performing, charade) storyline or statement in which the item appears; synonyms; antonyms; translations related ideas and collocations (image, object); demonstration (performing, charade) storyline or statement in which the item appears; synonyms; antonyms; translations related ideas and collocations. In T1 and T2, each chapter introduces vocabulary in one of the following methods. For example, on page 2 of T1 chapter 1, the vocabulary is taught by matching the words to their definitions. T1 utilizes synonyms in chapter 2 and visuals in chapter 3. Each chapter introduces the terminology in a unique way. T2, like T1, introduces vocabulary in a variety of methods. T1 and T2 also have a sufficient vocabulary range and quantity. Each chapter provides a new vocabulary of roughly 10-20 new terms that are also "learnable" for kids. As a result of the foregoing explanation, T1 and T2 have met the second criteria.

For pronunciation work T2 includes material for pronunciation work by giving the students the listening material and then students are asked to pronounce the phrases or sentences correctly. Therefore, T2 has met the criteria. Meanwhile T1 does not have any audio for listening but it prepares pronunciation practice only for words which will be read by teacher and students will repeat after teacher that can be inaccurately pronounce. In this case, writer consider that T1 has not met the criteria.

For this criteria both books have met the criteria, as can be seen from the exercises and the role play activities. Each chapter provides exercises based on the grammar and vocabulary by developing them into sentence or into dialog. The dialog then practiced through role plays activities, presentation or group discussion. So that students are able to participate in conversation, to create sentences and dialog in real life situation.

Language style is divided into five categories: frozen, formal, consultative, informal, and intimate. (Joss, M; 1976, p. 153-157). The social setting of the book is teenager or generation Z. Generation Z (Gen Z) refers to those born since 1996 until 2012. The language used in Gen Z mostly casual. They develop unique style in conversation, using jargons, acronyms or slangs are common. Based on writer analysis, most of the styles that are used in the coursebooks are formal. Some of the chapters use casual language or example in T1 chapter 2 the topic is about "Congratulating and Complimenting others". The book not only introduces one word "congratulation" to congratulate others which is mostly used in frozen and formal situation but T1 also gives some words that are not formal but casual for example "Fantastic", "Good for you", "Wonderful." Some of those words are also found in T2 chapter 3 with the same topic. But mostly they use formal language

and do not convey the generation Z language style. So, based on that language style used, both books are not representing the student' (gen Zs') language style. In this criteria T1 and T2 have not met the criteria.

4) Skills

In this skill category, Textbook 1 has met 5 of the 6 criteria: 1) four skills are generally addressed while taking into account the course goals and syllabus requirements, 2) there is material that incorporates cooperative learning work, and 3) the reading texts and tasks are appropriate for the students' standard and preferences, and there is enough material; 4) the material for spoken English is quite well to prepare students for real-life conversations; and 5) there are essay writing with sufficient guidance, degree of accuracy, and other factors. While Textbook 2 meets 5 of 6 criteria which are 1) Four skills are properly covered, taking into account the course objectives and course requirements; 2) there is material that incorporates integrated skill work and learning; and 3) listening material is well-recorded 4) The reading passages and exercises are appropriate for the learners' level of understanding and interest, and there is enough information.,5)The spoken English material is well-designed to prepare students to the real world interactions and situations. and. For these criteria T1 has met 83% and T2 have met 100% of the criteria.

Table 5 Skills

NO	Checklist Criteria	T1	T2
IV	Skills		
	1. Considering the course goals and curriculum criteria, four skills were adequately covered.	1	1
	2. .Work on integrated skills is possible with the resources.	1	1
	3. There is enough reading material, as well as reading passages and accompanying activities that are appropriate for learners' levels, interests, and other factors.	1	1
	4. The audio is well-recorded and as accurate as possible, with background information, questions, and exercises to help comprehension.	0	1
	5. The spoken English material (dialogues, roleplays, etc.) is well-designed to prepare students for real-life situations.	1	1
	6. Writing skills are acceptable in terms of the quantity of guideline, the level of quality, the arrangement of longer writings (e.g., paragraphing), and the use of appropriate styles.	1	1
	Total	5	6
	Percentage	83%	100 %

Table 3 showed that both books have provided the four skills integratedly and age-appropriate because the topic is about the daily life, cultural story, tourist site and about other related things. Even though writer thinks that the topic should embrace the generation Z characteristics, over all the language skill are taught integratedly. In one chapter they are not focus only on one language skill but also focus on the three other skills. Each chapter started by introducing the target vocabulary which is important to build sentence. Then there will be listening part to drill the students pronunciation and comprehension. After that, there are

reading part which uses the target vocabulary and some questions are provided to check the student's comprehension. Along with that then the next part is writing and speaking. Writing activities can be done by jotting down the answers for the comprehension questions or create a story based on the topic using the target vocabulary. Then continued with the speaking activities where students are asked to create dialog or give presentation. So by applying integrated skills in the books students are able to develop the vocabulary and the grammar into dialog or presentation or conversation in real life situation.

Reading comprehension is an interaction process between the text and the reader's prior background knowledge, according to Schema theory (Adams & Allan, 1977). The reading passage should be suitable with the thought of the students. Based on this criteria T1 and T2 have already provided suitable reading passages and activities for students' level as can be seen the topics are about how to congratulate and compliments others, MalinKundang and other tales from Indonesia and about famous tourist sites from all over the world. Those topics are suitable to the students' thought that is why T1 and T2 already met the criteria.

A well recorded listening material is really important to make the listening activities authentic. Listening material is better accompanied with questions and activities to help students comprehending the listening material. Based on this criteria T1 does not have a well recorded listening material so for this part T1 has not met the criteria, however T2 provides a well recorded listening material (audio) along with comprehension question. Therefore, for this criteria T2 has met the criteria.

When learners are able to use the language for real-life interaction or in the context of their own lives, it is called as personalization. It is a good thing because the emphasis is on making language learning relevant to the students so it is more motivating and furthermore more memorable. How to equip the students is by giving them opportunities to practice from dialogue examples, role-play, by giving presentation, talk about a topic or summarize a reading, show and tell and etc. Both T1 and T2 have given well-designed spoken English material to equip the learners by giving many dialogue examples, role-play, etc. Therefore, both T1 and T2 have met the criteria.

One of the communicative abilities is writing. The writing process is a tool for students to improve their learning. The writing process began with 1) imparting the vocabulary required for writing, and 2) providing grammar and organization. 3) Construction of sentences 4) Text Arrangement and 5) Constructing Paragraphs

In T1 and T2, each chapter has completed the writing process. Each paragraph began with a vocabulary introduction and grammatical lesson, followed by exercises to help students build sentences. The learners are then instructed on how to construct a paragraph through a text organization explanation. T1 and T2 have both met the requirements based on this criteria.

5) Topic

Topic is what the lesson is about. Topic selection is about choosing the right topic for the students cultural context. To be able to understand the cultural context of high school students the writer define them as teenager or young adult students. Based on Lancaster and Stillman (2002) perspective in Reilly (Reilly,

2006) learners in this age are considered as Generation Z (born in 2000 – 2012). The characteristic of Generation Z (gen Z) can be characterized as follows: (Harmanto, 2012):

1. *Tech Savvy*. They are known as digital native, living with technology since they were born. They can grasp and master advance new technology more quickly than previous generations. Most of their time spent doing screen activities that reducing their time playing outdoor.
2. *Social Networking*. Various social networking platforms are commonly used to send instant message or information. As a result there is a lack of privacy for this generation. Gadgets make communication easy and quick, so that they are very collaborative and creative.
3. *Multitasking*. Gen Z is use to texting, reading, watching, talking and eating simultaneously. They are known as multitaskers. So, it is difficult for them to focus on one thing in a long time and absorb complex information..
4. *Speedy*. Multitasking brings impact in the learners attention span. They have a very short attention span that influence the way they study.

Gen Z also enjoys discussing about digital marketing, video content, coding and technology in general. They also want to be perceived as environmentally aware. So that topic selection is fundamentally important for energizing and making up the classroom. In the topic category, the criteria were 1) a sufficient amount of information of real concern to learners, 2) a sufficient diversity and scope of topics, and 3) a decent amount of variation and number of topics. 3) The themes assist students broaden their horizons and enhance their perspectives. 4) The themes are complex enough in content while being within the language level of learning. 5) Students are able to connect with the social and cultural context presented in the topics. 6) Women are equally featured and represented as males. 7) Other ethnic groups, occupations, and disabilities are all represented. etc.

These two textbooks include a wide range of themes, including travel and tourist destinations, famous individuals, teen living styles, and issues that cross traditional subject lines such as history and geography, ethnic origin, and pertinent articles. A question has been posed, are such themes sufficient to pique learners' curiosity and interest? According to the previous explanation of the issues that fascinate the Z generation, the topics in both books are insufficient and complex enough to pique the students' interest. The subjects included in the books are primarily common issues that do not elicit any questions or pique the learners' attention. They don't talk about the cultural backdrop of the topics, which is crucial for Z generation. The social and cultural topics are also do not represent the students social and cultural's life. Because they do not present the topics that suitable to the Z generation.

They do, however, cover a broad variety of topics that help students broaden their horizons and deepen their perspective. Because the terminology has been introduced previously and the language level is appropriate for them, students are able to comprehend the topics and also women are also portrayed equally with men. The topics also present cultural legend about certain area that represent the ethnicity.

Based on these criteria, textbook 1 and textbook 2 have met 5 of 7 criteria. So, textbook 1 and textbook 2 have met 71 % of the criteria.

Table 6 Topic

NO	Checklist Criteria	T1	T2
V	Topic		
	1. There is enough content that is of actual interest to the students.	0	0
	2. Having a wide enough selection of topics to choose from	1	1
	3. The themes assist students broaden their horizons and deepen their experiences.	1	1
	4. The content of the themes is comprehensive enough, but they are still within the language level of the learners.	1	1
	5. Students should be able to connect with the social and cultural settings found in the books	0	0
	6. Women are depicted and represented in the same way as men.	1	1
	7. Other ethnic groups, professions, disabilities, and other variables are all represented.	1	1
Total		5	5
Percentage		71%	71%

6) Methodology

In terms of methodology, Textbook 1 and 2 have met 6 of 7 criteria of good methodology. The criteria that meet are 1)the approach is suitable with the learning/teaching situation, 2)the level of active learner and learning styles match the students, 3)the appropriateness of teaching technique, 4)the way the different skills are taught, 5) the ability of the textbook to help the students develop communicative abilities, 6) the textbook provides the learners to take some initiative for their own learning. For these criteria, textbook 1 has met 86% checklist criteria.

Table 6 Methodology

NO	Checklist Criteria	T1	T2
VI	Methodology		
	1. What approach(es) to language acquisition does the coursebook take?Is this appropriate in a learning/teaching environment?	1	1
	2. What level of active learner participation should be expected?Is this in line with the learning preferences and needs of your students?	1	0
	3. What methods are utilized to introduce/practice new language items?Are they appropriate for your students?	1	1
	4. What methods are used to teach the various skills?	1	1
	5. What factors influence the development of language competence?	1	1
	6. Is there any advise or assistance for students on study skills and learning methods in the material?	0	0

	7. Is it required of students to take some responsibility for their own learning (for example, by defining their own personal goals)?	1	1
Total		6	5
Percentage		86%	71%

A language teaching strategy is a way of thinking about how to teach and learn in a foreign language. There are several common techniques to language learning, but task-based learning, communicative approach, grammar translation, audio-lingual approach, and Project-Based Learning are the most well-known. Using those methods, writer considers that T1 and T2 mix the communicative and Project-Based Learning approaches. The activities given to pupils demonstrate this. And these approaches are appropriate for the learning and teaching situation. From these approaches, T1 and T2 have met the criteria.

As aforementioned, there are some learning styles based on theory. There are 4 (four) kinds of learning styles which are VARK (Visual, Audio, Reading and Kinesthetic). Those have already explained before. T1 provides various kind of teaching techniques to Based on the activities given in T1 and in the teacher's guide T1 and T2 use communicative approach that involve the student to be active in the learning process. T2 gives some teaching techniques in each chapter although T1 gives more teaching techniques than T2 that match all of the students' learning styles. Therefore, T1 and T2 have met the criteria.

There are some techniques used to present and practice new vocabulary such as by answering questions, through pictures or story, through activities/games and followed with collaborative work in pairs or in groups. These kinds of techniques are suitable for young learners. T1 and T2 have met the third criteria because they already provided some teaching techniques and collaboration works in the books. And Since the approaches use in this book are communicative and Project Based learning, so the different skills are taught through activities and project. It involves collaborative learning. Therefore T1 and T2 have met the fourth criteria.

The communicative abilities are developed by doing activities in pairs, in groups and also individually through role-play, show and tell or giving presentation. After screening every chapter of these books, writer cannot find any advice for students on study skills and learning strategies. In T1 and T2 students can find self-reflection part where they can reflect what they have learnt and have met the objectives. Then, students are asked to write or present the result of their reflection. So, they have responsibility about their own learning.

7) Practical Consideration

Practical Consideration is about practical aspects that need to consider. In practical consideration category, textbook 1 has met 3 out of 4 criteria. They are 1)the cost for the entire program that represent reasonable price; the book is durable and long-lasting, with a pleasing appearance., 3)it is also easy to obtain. For these category, textbook 1 has met 75% checklist criteria.

In this category textbook 2 has met all of the criteria which are 1) the cost for the whole package that represent good value for money. 2) The book is strong and long lasting and has an attractive appearance. 3)It is also simple to obtain,

4)The package necessitates the use of specific listening equipment. For these criteria textbook 2 has met 100% checklist criteria.

Table 7 Practical Consideration

NO	Checklist Criteria	T1	T2
VIII	Practical Consideration		
	1. What is the total cost of the package? Is this a good value for money purchase?	1	1
	2. Is the material of the books durable and long-lasting? Do they have a pleasing appearance?	1	1
	3. Is it simple to obtain them? Is it possible to obtain additional supplies on reasonable terms?	1	1
	4. Is there anything in the package that requires special equipment, such as a language lab, a listening center, or a video player? If so, do you have the necessary equipment and is it reliable?	0	1
Total		3	4
Percentage		75%	100%

T1 that published by Ministry of Education and Culture can be accessed by students through application and download it without any charge at playstore. On the other hand students have to spend some money for having T2. The range of the price is from Rp.85.000 – Rp.115.000 for 206 pages with Art Carton paper for cover. So, it can be calculated that for 1 page the price is only Rp.550 which the writer considers as a very good value for money.

T1 and T2 are considered strong, long-lasting and have attractive appearance. As aforementioned T1 can be accessed through application and downloadable, so as long as the application is still exist the book will also exist. As for T2 the paper material is good and thick so it is long-lasting. They are also considered attractive in appearance because they have pictures and colorful, and the covers have the message and the fonts in the books are not too vary.

Both T1 and T2 are easy to obtain. For T1 students can obtain it from application in playstore and T2 are available in online or offline bookstore such as Gramedia. And the supplies are always available.

As aforementioned, T1 does not provide any audio package so it does not need any laboratory or listening centre but it needs an android to access the book. And it is also downloadable, so learner who does not have android can download the book first through PC or Android from friends' or teachers'. On the other hand, T2 is not available in playstore but it needs a Reading QR Code application to listen to the audio through mobile phone. Students should scan the QR Code in order to be able to listen to the listening parts. Since mobile phone is a common device nowadays for students.

From the data analysis the result of this research showed that from 40 checklist criteria of Cunningsworth, "Bahasa Inggris Kelas X" has fulfill 32 (thirty two) criteria. The result of the research also shows that "Pathway to English" has fulfilled 35 (thirty five) criteria of 40 (forty) criteria suggested by Cunningsworth.

$$\text{Percentage} = \frac{\sum X}{N} \times 100\%$$

Derived from the formula we can count the percentage as follows:

$$T1 \longrightarrow 32/40 \times 100 \% = 80 \%$$

$$T2 \longrightarrow 35/40 \times 100 \% = 87 \%$$

It can be concluded that T1 book has met 80% fulfillment percentage that shows that this book has a "good" standard as a coursebook. And T2 has fulfilled 87% of the checklist criteria which shows that the book is "good" book too as shown in the table :

Table 8 Evaluation Summary Table

Books	Fulfillment Percentage	Statement
BahasaInggris (T1)	80 %	Good
Pathway to English Kelas X (T2)	87 %	Good

The result and summary can be seen in the next table :

Table 9 Result and Summary

No.	Checklist Category	Number of Checklist Criteria	T1 Result	Percentage Result	T2 Result	Percentage Result
1.	Aims and Approaches	4	4	100%	4	100%
2.	Design and Organization	7	7	100%	7	100%
3	Language Content	5	3	60%	4	80%
4	Skills	6	5	83%	6	100%
5	Topic	7	5	71%	5	71%
6	Methodology	7	5	71%	5	71%
7	Practical Consideration	4	3	75%	4	100%
	Total	40	32	80%	35	87%

Discussion

The investigation's purpose is to answer the question whether "BahasaInggris" by Kementikbud and "Pathway to English" by Erlangga for tenth grade are suitable for teachers and tenth grade learners. The writer decided to conduct the research because of the importance of the using of good textbook in language class. Richards (2011) states that textbooks are essential component in most language programs. Textbook play an important role for teachers as guidance and as supplement information especially for teachers who are not native speaker.

It is also important as assistant for teachers to plan a lesson and to manage the time spent in teaching learning process. Whereas for learners textbook is important to help them engage with the lesson and help learners to have the same interpretation about the lesson. Teachers and learners have the same standard about what is expected to learn. So by using textbook students are expected to be able to create conversations, to involve in discussions, activities or role plays that can save teachers' time to achieve the objectives. So, it can be concluded that in the teaching and learning process, textbooks play a critical role.

Aside from the advantages textbooks also have weaknesses. Cunningsworth (1995) states that adopting new textbooks and finding strengths and weaknesses are the main reason for textbook evaluation.

The other reason for writer to conduct this research is despite the many choices of books availability in the market teachers might find difficulties in selecting the appropriate textbook. They might find it difficult to select a compatible textbook suitable for students needs in terms of vocabulary, abilities, and communication techniques. The right book helps learners to learn the material effectively. Therefore, the result of this research is crucial to help teachers choosing the appropriate textbooks.

For these reasons, the author decided to undertake a textbook review. As previously indicated, a number of experts offered some suggestions and checklist for evaluating textbooks. From all of the suggestions the writer adopted Cunningsworth's checklist criteria theory as the basis for her investigation. Cunningsworth proposed eight aspects, but this study only used seven of them to determine if the books are good textbooks. There are 40 checklist criteria for 1) aims and objectives, 2) design and structure, 3) linguistic content, 4) skills, 5) Topic, 6) Methodology, and 7) Practical Consideration.

After deciding which theory was used, then the writer chose the object of the research. In this case she chose "Bahasa Inggris" and "Pathway to English" for tenth grade students as the object of the study. The checklist criteria were used to analyzed the books. In order to make it simple the writer then set a coding categories by using tick and cross to check whether the answers of the questions are found or not in the books. Tick has 1(one) value and cross (x) has 0 (zero) value. Then, the categories were broken into 7 tables with 40 checklist questions. The tables consist of 4 coloums, the first column was for number and the second column was filled with the question criterion. The third and fourth column were where the tick or cross was applied. Column 3 (three) represent "Bahasa Inggris" and column 4 (four) represent "Pathway to English". The writer scrutinized the books while applying the tick and cross in the tables. The percentage was then computed by dividing the total number of criteria values met in each sub aspect in a textbook by the total number of criteria points in that sub aspects. The last is writing a report about the result of the evaluation based on the findings in each table category.

The result of the evaluation shows that both books are regarded good books based on the percentage results, while "Pathway to English" has a better result than "Bahasa Inggris" with 87 percent and 80 percent fulfillment, respectively. It implies that both books are appropriate for pupils in tenth grade. Yet, the result also showed that they did not achieve all of the criteria in the checklist. "Bahasa Inggris"

needs to improve the materials in terms of language content, skills, topics and methodology. It needs to improve the pronunciation material for individual sounds, words stress, sentence stress and intonation with a well-recorded audio. While "Pathway to English" needs to improve the materials in methodology in terms of teaching techniques and learning styles. The activities suggested in the book do not cover all learning styles because of the lack of teaching techniques proposed.

Meanwhile, both books have the same weaknesses in terms of language content, topics and methodology. They do not cover the language styles of generation Z students. They need to conduct a need analysis about what topic and language styles interest the generation Z students. They need to adapt and provide some slang words and topic about recent jobs, social media interest and cover some digital activities such as creating a video about tips on how to learn English fast on TikTok or Instagram, making vlog and et cetera. The last, both books need to provide tips and trick section to give advice for students on how to study the skills based on learner's learning strategies. It seems possible that these results are due to the change of generations characteristics and the lack of needs analysis.

To our knowledge this is not the first study that has analyzed the content of English textbook. These findings of research are consistent with those of Dilla, Rut Glory (Dilla et al., 2017) who found that the material components in "Bahasa Inggris" need to be improved and the listening part should provide more on pronunciation task and audio, but overall the book is still considered as good book. The checklist criteria that used to evaluate the book was proposed by Permendikbud number 08 2016 and some experts (Cunningsworth, 1995) Celce-Murcia (1979). This findings also agree with Syale. Ari Sihad (Ari Sihad Syale et al., 2018) that suggested that teachers to be more critical and use supplementary resources along with the textbook.

However, the findings of the current study do not support the study conducted by Arifah, KurniaFitri (Arifah et al., 2018) in their research about "Bahasa Inggris" book quality. The result confirmed the resources were found to be compatible with each of the core and fundamental competencies or 100% percent of the book meet the criteria. Whereas this study found that the book can not achieve all of the criteria.

This study is also consistent with the study from Kurniati, Suci et al (Arifah et al., 2018) that found that "Pathway to English" has met the quality as a good book although it still requires more consideration in some aspects so teachers need to have supplementary resources. The difference is in the criteria that used to conduct the research. It used the rubric proposed by BNSP.

It can thus be suggested that although both books are considered as good books, teachers are suggested to find and use other resources as additional information. It is possible to hypothesize that this condition occurs because of the change in teenagers cultural context, characteristics and the lack of need analysis.

The findings of this study suggest that beside hard copies the books can also provide a compatible internet based or digital based supplementary work book, activity book that cover all of the language skills to boost the interest of learners to learn English.

Conclusion

This section summarizes and concludes the findings of the study, which examined the content of Kemendikbud's Bahasa Inggris for Tenth Grade and Erlangga's Pathway to English for Tenth Grade books. It also makes suggestions for authors and publishers to consider.

A textbook is necessary for the teaching and learning process. It assists teachers in planning and organizing lessons, as well as assisting students in comprehending the material presented by teachers. As a result, teachers should be able to select the appropriate book for the class, one that will help both teachers and students achieve the lesson's objectives. However, despite the abundance of English books on the market, not all teachers know how to select a decent book.

This research compares and contrasts two books: Kemendikbud's "Bahasa Inggris Kelas X" and Erlangga's "Pathway to English." The study's research questions are whether or not the English textbooks Buku Bahasa Inggris and Pathway to English met the requirements for an excellent textbook according to Cunningsworth's theory. Pathway to English has ten chapters, whereas Kemendikbud's Buku Bahasa Inggris has fifteen. It is intended to be used for two semesters. Cunningsworth's theory is used in the research. Cunningsworth suggests 45 (fifty-five) checklist criteria for evaluating a coursebook. The checklist criteria are classified into 8 (eight) major criteria. They are 1) Aims and Approaches, 2) Design and Organization, 3) Language Content, 4) Skills, 5) Topic, 6) Methodology, 7) Teacher's book and 8) Practical Consideration. The goal of this study is to see if both volumes meet the theory-based criteria for an excellent textbook. The study's conclusions should be valuable and relevant to writers, teachers, and other academics.

T1 and T2 are good books for students and learners in Indonesia, according to the researcher's findings. T1 has completed 80% of the checklist requirements, whereas T2 has completed 87 percent of the checklist criteria. Both have strengths and weaknesses. T1 has made student book applications available in the Google Play Store, which are free to use and may be accessed by either teachers or students. However, it does not have any audio component for the listening section. T2, on the other hand, offers listening audio that may be accessed by scanning a QR code with a smartphone in each listening segment. Unlike T1, T2 is not available on the Play Store, and students must purchase it; nonetheless, the cost is extremely reasonable.

References

- Adams, M. ., & Allan, C. (1977). *A Schema Theoretic of Reading*. University of Illinois.
- Apriyani, L. A., & Robiasih, R. H. (2019). Eight grade text book evaluation by Cunningsworth's theory. *Journal of English Language and Pedagogy*, 2(2), 94. <https://doi.org/10.36597/jelp.v2i2.4865>
- Ari Sihad Syale, Kamaluddin, K., & Siam, S. (2018). CONTENT ANALYSIS ON THE ENGLISH TEXTBOOK ENTITLED. *Journal of Teaching of English*, 4, 226–239.
- Arifah, K. F., Santosa, R., & Ngadiso, N. (2018). Content Analysis of Competences and Scientific Approach in English Textbook. *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 5(3), 219. <https://doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v5i3.367>
- B, A., Akib, E., & Amin, B. (2021). Promoting The Students Speaking Skill By

- Implementing Collaborative Learning Method In Teaching Speaking Skill. IDEAS: Journal on English Language Teaching and Learning, Linguistics and Literature, 9(1). doi: <https://doi.org/10.24256/ideas.v9i1.1966>
- Blooms, B. (1956). *TAXONOMY OF EDUCATIONAL OBJECTIVES The Classification of Educational Goals HANDBOOK 1 COGNITIVE DOMAIN*.
- Cunningsworth, A. (1995). *Choosing-your-coursebook*. Mcmillan Publishers Limited.
- Dilla, R. G., Damayanti, I., & Hati, G. M. (2017). the Content Analysis of Bahasa Inggris Textbook for Senior High School Grade X Published By Kemendikbud 2014. *Journal of English Education and Teaching*, 1(1), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.33369/jeet.1.1.1-8>
- Graves, K. (2000). *Designing-Language-Courses-a-Guide-for-Teachers.pdf*. Heinley Thomson Learning.
- Harmanto, B. (2012). Teaching English to Generation Z students (New concept of young learners) A . Young Learners as Generation Z. *Fjsnf*.
- Mukundan, J., & Nimehchisalem, V. (2012). Evaluative Criteria of an English Language Textbook Evaluation Checklist. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 3(6), 1128–1134. <https://doi.org/10.4304/jltr.3.6.1128-1134>
- Reilly, P. (2006). Understanding and Teaching Generation Y. *English Teaching Forum*, 50(1), 2–11. <http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ971235.pdf>
- Richards, J. C. (2010). Curriculum development in second language teaching. In *The Language Teaching Matrix*. <https://doi.org/10.1017/cbo9780511667152.003>
- Sheldon, L. E. (1988). Evaluating ELT textbooks_Sheldon.pdf. *ELT Journal*, 42(4), 237–246. <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc>
- Syafii, M. (2019). Improving the Quality in Writing Descriptive Texts of Madrasah Aliyah Students Through Directed Writing Activity Strategy. IDEAS: Journal on English Language Teaching and Learning, Linguistics and Literature, 7(2). doi: <https://doi.org/10.24256/ideas.v7i2.1027>
- Tyas, P. A., & Safitri, M. (2019). An Analysis of English Textbook Entitled "Bahasa Inggris SMA/MA SMK/MAK Kelas X." *JEES (Journal of English Educators Society)*, 4(1), 17–22. <https://doi.org/10.21070/jees.v4i1.1777>