IDEAS

Journal of Language Teaching and Learning, Linguistics and Literature

Issued by English study program of IAIN Palopo

Narrative Text Translation by the Students of English Education Study Program

Muhammad Zein Hardiansyah[1], Anjar Ksuuma Dewi [2], Sriati Usman[3]
[1]muhammadzeinhardiansyah@gmail.com [2]anjardewi.kusuma@gmail.com
[3]sriati_endro@yahoo.com
[1,2,3]Pend. Bahasa Inggris, Universitas Tadulako, Palu, Sulawesi Tengah

Abstract

This research aims to find out the translation methods that are mostly used by students of the English Education Study Program. Kind of this research is qualitative research. The subjects in this research were 10 students of Tadulako University specifically in English Education Study Program who had enrolled in the Translation and Interpretation course and selected using the snowball technique. The instrument in this research is the translation test. In analyzing the data, the researcher used the Newmark translation method theory. The results of this research indicate that there are only five translation methods applied by students in translating a text. The translation method that is mostly used by students is free translation method. The second is communicative translation method. The third is idiomatic translation method. Then, the fourth is literal translation method. The last position is faithful translation method. Meanwhile, it was also identified methods that were not applied by students, including word-for-word translation method, semantic translation method, and adaptation translation method. So, it can be concluded the free translation method is a translation method that is mostly applied by English education students at Tadulako University. The results of this research also indicate that the students applied more than one method in translating a text dan they tend to apply translation methods that emphasize the target language.
Keywords: Analysis; Narrative Text; Translation Method,

Introduction

Translation can be defined as a process of transferring the meaning contained in a written text in one language as the source language (SL) into another language as the target language (TL). Hatim and Munday, (2004: 6) argue, translation is "the process of transferring a written text from SL to TL, conducted by a translator, or translators, in a specific socio-cultural context." Meanwhile, Catford, (1965: 20) defines, translation as "the replacement of textual material in one language (SL) by equivalent textual material in another language (TL)." In general, the purpose of translation is to translate or transfer the meaning contained in the source language into the target language writing culture.

Translation is also defined as an activity that involves two different languages. As Toury, (1995: 56) argues, translation is "a kind of activity which inevitably involves at least two languages and two cultural traditions." While, Newmark, (1988: 5) defines "Translation is rendering the meaning of a text into another language in the way that the author intended the text." Based on the definitions above, all have the same purpose to translate the source language written text into the context of the target language writing culture so that the target language readers can accept the meaning of the text following the meaning contained in the source language.

Narrative text is a form of communication in which a person called a narrator tells a story whether based on reality or fiction to others or is referred to as narrates. Prince (2003) argues, the narrative is an activity to tell a story whether the story is real or fictional, which is told by the narrators to other people (narratees) (p. 58). In the narrative text, there is a genre. It can also be mentioned as types, kinds, and subgenres, in narrative fiction. Keen (2003) divides the narrative subgenre into several subgenres including adventure, comic novels, fairy tales, fantasy, historical fiction, horror stories, romances, satire, short stories, science fiction, thrillers, etc (p. 143).

Lack of understanding of translation methods is one of the reasons why students have difficulty translating a text. The translation method is related to the intent, purpose, and desire of the translator, the translation method has a very large impact on the results of the translation of the whole text. In translating, the choice of translation method is quite important. That is because the use of the right translation method can make the translation process more efficient and the translation results more effective.

Newmark (1988) proposed eight translation methods and grouped them into two major groups. The first four methods are used for translating which emphasize

the source language (SL), including *word-for-word translation*, *literal translation*, *faithful translation*, and *semantic translation*, while the next four methods emphasize the target language (TL), including *adaptation*, *free translation*, *idiomatic translation*, and *communicative translation*.

Based on the relevant research, Nugraha, Nugroho, and Rahman (2017) focus to find the translation method used in translating the short story "A Blunder" by Anton Chekhov and also finding the equivalence in the translation. While research by Mutaqin and Sulistyawati (2020) only focuses to found out whether a literal translation method was used in the short story entitled Mercury and the Carpenter or not. Meanwhile, Research by Muhammad, Zaim, and Syafei (2017) analyzed translation methods and techniques.

To fill the gap, it is crucial to conduct research on Narrative Text Translation by the Students of English Education Study Program which is focus more on the translation method used by the students in translating narrative text entitled "the Fox and the Cat" by Aesop's Fables. This research aims to find out the types of translation methods that are mostly used by students in translating narrative text.

Method

In this research, the researchers applied a qualitative research design. The subjects of this research are the 10 students of Tadulako University specifically in the English Education Study Program who have enrolled in the translation and interpretation course. Then, the researcher used a snowball technique to get the subject. In this qualitative research, the primary instruments are the researchers. They are referred to as a human instrument and they are the key instrument in the research. To obtain proper data and follow the research objectives, the researchers used a test to find out the kinds of translation methods used by the students of English Education Study Program in translating English narrative text into Indonesian.

The test given is in the form of a translation test from the source language (English) to the target language (Indonesian) a short narrative story entitled The Fox and The Cat by Aesop's Fables. Then, the data from the test will be analyzed in each paragraph using the approach of the classification translation method by Newmark.

Results

- **Student 1**

Free Translation and Idiomatic Translation	
Source Language (SL) **Paragraph 1**	**Target Language (TL)** **Paragraph 1**
A Fox was bragging to a Cat about its clever escape mechanisms.. "I have a whole bag of tricks," he said, "which contains a hundred ways of escaping my enemies."	Rubah membanggakan kecerdasannya dalam meloloskan diri dari musuhnya kepada kucing. Rubah berkata "saya mempunyai sangat banyak taktik," "terdapat ratusan cara untuk lolos dari musuh."

Analysis:

Student 1 applied the free translation method and the idiomatic translation method in this paragraph. The free translation method can be seen in the sentence *"A Fox was boasting to a Cat of its clever devices for escaping its enemies."* Which she translates to **"Rubah membanggakan kecerdasannya dalam meloloskan diri dari musuhnya kepada kucing."** While the idiomatic translation method can be seen in the sentence *"I have a whole bag of tricks," he said,".* Which she translates to **"saya mempunyai sangat banyak taktik," kata rubah,"**. The word *"whole bag"*, she translates to **"sangat banyak"**.

Literal Translation and Free Translation	
Source Language (SL) **Paragraph 2**	**Target Language (TL)** **Paragraph 2**
"I have only one," said the Cat; "but I can generally manage with that." Just at that moment they heard the cry of a pack of hounds coming towards them, and the Cat immediately scampered up a tree and hid herself in the boughs.	"Saya hanya punya satu," kata Kucing, "Tetapi saya dapat mengandalkan itu." Seketika, mereka mendengar tangisan segerombolan anjing mendatangi mereka, lalu kucing seketika memanjat pohon dan bersembunyi dibalik dahan.

Analysis:

In the second paragraph, student 1 applied the literal translation method and the free

translation method. The literal translation method in the paragraph is in the sentence *"I have only one," said the Cat;"* which she translates to **"Saya hanya punya satu," kata Kucing"**. The phrase "have only" has been translated literally according to the Indonesian structure into **"hanya punya"**. While the free translation method can be seen in the sentence *"but I can generally manage with that."* Which she translates to **"Tetapi saya dapat mengandalkan itu."** In the phrase *"generally manage with that"* translated freely into **"mengandalkan itu"**.

Free Translation and Communicative Translation	
Source Language (SL) Paragraph 3	**Target Language (TL) Paragraph 3**
"This is my strategy," the Cat stated. "How do you intend to proceed?" The Fox considered one path, then another, and while he deliberated, the hounds drew closer and closer, until the Fox was cornered and killed by the huntsmen.	Kucing berujar "Ini rencanaku," "Apa yang akan kau lakukan?" Rubah memikirkan rencananya satu persatu, dan saat ia berdebat, kawanan anjing semakin mendekat dan mendekat, dan akhirnya, Rubah dan segala kebingungannya tertangkap oleh kawanan anjing dan lalu terbunuh oleh pemburu.

Analysis:

Student 1 used free translation and communicative translation methods in the third paragraph. The application of free translation can be seen in the sentence *"The Fox thought first of one way, then of another,"* which she translated into **"Rubah memikirkan rencananya satu persatu,"** the phrase *"first of one way, then another"*, it is translated freely become **"rencananya satu persatu"**. While the communicative translation method can be seen in the sentence "*and at last the Fox in his confusion,*" it is translated become **"dan akhirnya, Rubah dan segala kebingungannya"**. In the translation sentence, there is an additional word **"segala"** which is not found in the SL. Thus, the translator tries to make the TL readers easy to understand the context of the story.

Communicative Translation	
Source Language (SL) Paragraph 4	**Target Language (TL) Paragraph 4**
Miss Puss, who was observing, said, "Better one safe way than a hundred you can't count on."	Si Kucing, yang melihat apa yang terjadi, berkata " Lebih baik satu cara daripada seratus cara yang tidak bisa dikondisikan."

Analysis:

In the fourth paragraph, student 1 applied the communicative translation method in translating the paragraph. It can be seen in the sentence *"Miss Puss, who had been looking on"*, which she translates to **"Si Kucing, yang melihat apa yang terjadi"**. in that sentence, she adds the word **"terjadi"** to her translation to convey the contextual meaning of SL so that TL readers

can understand it well.

Based on the results of the test that have been analyzed using the theory of translation methods by Newmark, the researchers found that most of the translation methods used by 10 English students at Tadulako University as research subjects are free translation methods used 25 times. Then, followed the communicative translation method in the second place which was used 10 times. In third place is the idiomatic translation method which is used 8 times. In fourth place is the literal translation method which is used 5 times. The last place is the faithful translation method which is used at least 3 times. Meanwhile, it was also identified translation methods that were not used by students, including word-for-word translation method, semantic translation method, and adaptation translation method. The researchers go into greater detail about the aforementioned findings in the table below.

Translation Method	Subjects										Total Usage
	1	**2**	**3**	**4**	**5**	**6**	**7**	**8**	**9**	**10**	
Word-for-word Translation	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	**0**
Literal Translation	1	1	1	-	-	2	-	-	-	-	**5**
Faithful Translation	-	-	-	2	-	-	-	1	-	-	**3**
Semantic Translation	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	**0**
Adaptation	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	**0**
Free Translation	3	1	3	1	3	2	2	3	4	3	**25**
Idiomatic Trasnaltion	1	1	-	2	1	1	1	1	-	-	**8**
Communicative Translation	2	2	1	1	1	1	1	-	-	1	**10**

Table 1. Findings of Translation Method Used
Source. Data Findings Analysis by Researcher

Discussion

The results of the test given show the free translation method is the method that is mostly applied by the research subjects. Of the 10 students, all of them applied this method when translating the test given. For example, student 9 applied this method 4 times and one of them is found in the sentence *"but I can generally manage with that."* Translated to **"tapi Aku dapat mengandalkan cara itu"**. The underlined phrase in the sentence was translated freely by prioritizing sentence structure in TL so that the translation results are easier for TL readers to understand. Meanwhile, the previous research was conducted by Nugraha, Nugroho, and Rahman, (2017: 79-86). Of the 5 participants, only 4 participants applied the free translation method and this method is the least used by participants in their research. They also found the application of the word-for-word translation method and adaptation translation method. Whereas, in the research conducted by the researchers, the results of the analysis did not show the application of the method. The same findings in research conducted by the researchers with previous research both of us did not found the application of the semantic translation method.

The second translation method that is mostly applied by the research subjects is the communicative translation method. Of the 10 students, 8 of them applied this method. For example, student 1 applied this method 2 times and one of them is found in the sentence *"Miss Puss, who had been looking on"*, which she translates to **"Si Kucing, yang melihat apa yang terjadi"**. in that sentence, she adds the word **"terjadi"** to her translation to convey the contextual meaning of SL so that TL readers can understand it well. Meanwhile, in previous research conducted by Nafisah, Hartono, and Yuliasri, (2019: 1-10). The communicative translation method is also in the second position as the method that is mostly applied to translate the text and it is relevant to the results obtained by researchers in this research.

The third translation method that is mostly applied by the research subjects is the idiomatic translation method. Of the 10 students, 7 of them applied this method. For example, student 4 applied this method 2 times and one of them is found in the sentence *"I have a whole bag of tricks"* translated to **"Saya memiliki banyak trik"** the phrase *"whole bag"*, which translates to **"banyak"**. If the phrase is translated using the faithful translation method, it will become **"seluruh tas"**. Whereas in previous research conducted by Muhammad, Zaim, and Syafei, (2017: 381-389). Their findings show that there are only 4 translation methods used and the idiomatic translation method is also in the third position as the method that is mostly applied to translate the text. It is relevant to the results obtained by researchers in this research.

The fourth translation method that is mostly applied by the research subjects is the literal translation method. Of the 10 students, 4 of them applied this method. For example, student 2 applied this method 1 time in the first paragraph and it can be seen in the sentence *"a fox was boasting to a cat of its clever devices for escaping its enemies"*. Which she translated into **"Seekor rubah membanggakan kepada kucing siasat cerdiknya untuk melarikan diri dari musuh."** The sentence was translated singly and linearly by the translator. If the sentence is translated freely it can be **seekor rubah membanggakan kecerdikannya dalam melarikan diri dari musuhnya kepada seekor kucing**. Whereas in previous research conducted by Fitriyani, and Wennyta, (2019: 125-138). They found from 26 students, the literal translation method was the most widely used. The second was word-for-word translation. The third was

free translation. The fourth was communicative translation. They also argued that it happened because students only translated the word according to the literal translation or the general translation they knew without considering the structure of the target language.

The fifth translation method that is mostly applied by the research subjects is the faithful translation method. Of the 10 students, 2 of them applied this method. For example, student 8 applied this method 1 time in the first paragraph and it can be seen in the sentence *"A Fox was boasting to a Cat of its clever devices for escaping its enemies"*. Translated to **"Seekor rubah membual kepada seekor kucing atas perangkat kepandaiannya dalam mengelabui musuh-musuhnya"**. The underlined phrase is translated using faithful translation while maintaining the original form even though it feels a little strange in TL. If the phrase is translated according to the TL structure, it would be better if it was translated into **"kepiawaiannya"**. In previous research conducted by Fauziah, Haryanti, Muttaqin, and Aridhayandi, (2018: 97-106). They found out of 12 respondents, 9 respondents answered using the faithful translation method. The other translation methods they found were word-for-word translation 10 respondents answered using this method, adaptation 5 respondents answered using this method, free translation 3 respondents answered using this method, and literal translation 3 respondents answered using this method.

From this research, the researchers also found three translation methods that were not applied by the research subjects, including word-for-word translation, semantic translation, and adaptation. In research conducted by Muhammad, Zaim, Syafei (2017: 381-389). They also did not find any use of word-for-word translation and adaptation methods in their research. Whereas in research conducted by Nugraha, Nugroho, and Rahman (2017: 79-86). They also did not find any use for semantic translation methods in their research.

Based on these findings, the researchers assume that students of the English Education Study Program who have enrolled Translation and Interpretation Course when they translate a text tend to apply translation methods that emphasize more on the target language, especially the free translation method when translating text and using more than one translation method when translating a text.

Conclusion

Based on the findings, it is concluded that most of the translation methods used by English students at Tadulako University who have enrolled for the translation and interpretation course are free translation methods. The second is communicative translation method. The third is idiomatic translation method. Then, the fourth is literal translation method. The last is faithful translation method. The translation methods based on Newmark theory that was not applied by the students were word-for-word translation method, semantic translation method, and adaptation translation method. The research also shows that students use more than one

translation method in translating a text.

It is suggested that more subjects be recruited in order to obtain more diverse data and to pursue this topic in order to obtain better results and support future research.

References

Aesop. (1867). The Fox and the Cat. *Aesop's Fables Greek*. Retrieved July 9, 2022, from https://fairytalez.com/the-fox-and-the-cat/

Catford. J. C. (1965). *A Linguistic Theory of Translation*. London: Oxford   University Press.

Fauziah, E., Haryanti, E., Muttaqin, M., and Aridhayandi, R. (2018). The Analysis of Under Graduate Students' Translation Work of News Text from English to Indonesia. *BELTIC*, 97-106.

Fitriyani, L., and Wennyta. (2019). An Analysis of Students' Narrative Text Translation from English to Indonesian at the Tenth Grade Students of SMA N 3 Kota Jambi Academic Year 2018/2019. *Jelt: Journal Of English Language teaching*, 3(2), 125-138.

Hatim, B. and Munday, J. (2004). *Translation: An advanced resource book*. New York: Routledge.

Keen, S. (2003). *Narrative Form*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Muhammad, F., Zaim, M., and Syafei, A. F. R. (2017). An Analysis of Methods of Translation Used by the Third Year Student of English Department of Universitas Negeri Padang in Translating Short Narrative Text From English to Bahasa Indonesia. *Journal of English Language Teaching*, 6(1), 381-389.

Mutaqin, E.Z. and Sulistyawati, W. (2020). The Analisis of Literal Translation Method English into Indonesian in Short Story Entitled "MERCURY AND THE CARPENTER". *Professional Journal of English Education*, 3(2), 266-270.

Nafisah, N. D., Hartono, R., and Yuliasri, I. (2019). Translation Methods and Degree of Equivalence in English-Indonesian Translation of Leo Tolstoy's "GOD SEES THE TRUTH BUT WAITS". *Rainbow: Journal of Literature, Linguistics, and Cultural Studies*, 1-10.

Newmark, P. (1988). *A Textbook of Translation*. Hertfordshire: Prentice HaH International vUIO Ltd.

Nugraha, A., Nughroho, M. A. B., and Rahman, Y. (2017). English – Indonesian Translation Methods in the Short Story "A Blunder" by Anton Chekhov. *Indonesian EFL Journal*, 3(1), 79-86.

Prince, G. (2003). *A Dictionary of Narratology* [1987]. Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press

Toury, G. (1995). *Descriptive Translation Studies and Beyond*. Amsterdam: Benjamins translation library.