



# Improve students' ability to understand English learning material through a personal approach to students

Ahmad Sulthan Adil Lillah<sup>1</sup>, M Zayyan Faiz An-nur<sup>2</sup>, Siti Maemunah<sup>3</sup>, Iis Nurul Hasanah<sup>4</sup>, Farida Hamid<sup>5</sup>

[iisnurulhasanah6@gmail.com](mailto:iisnurulhasanah6@gmail.com)

<sup>1</sup>English Education Department, UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup>English Education Department, UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, Indonesia

<sup>3</sup>English Education Department, UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, Indonesia

<sup>4</sup>English Education Department, UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, Indonesia

Received: 2023-12-13 Accepted: 2024-05-16

DOI: 10.24256/ideas.v12i1.4645

## Abstract

Personal and genre-based approaches are an approach to learning English as an EFL language, specifically in narrative text writing. So far, no research has conducted a comprehensive comparative analysis between these two approaches. The purpose of this study is to determine which of the personal approach and genre-based approaches is more suitable for practical application in teaching narrative writing in EFL classrooms. By using the qualitative design through post-tests in writing narratives, and then interviews. The participants were 11th graders at SMK YMJ CIPUTAT. The results show that the genre-based approach in writing narrative text is more effective and interesting and students prefer the genre-based approach, based on the analysis of student writing with a total score of 82, while the personal approach (experience) with a score of 76, but personal experience can provide an alternative writing method that is interesting to students. Therefore, the genre-based approach can be used as the main method in learning to write, while the personal approach can be used as a complementary method.

**Keywords:** *Writing, Genre - based approach, personal approach, narrative teks.*

**Introduction**

Teaching English is about an approach during the teaching process. The personal approach takes a different route, highlighting students' personal experiences and creativity. The term "personal" in this context stands distinct from "private". It doesn't imply forming friendships but rather emphasizes that the personal aspect of our identity shouldn't be disregarded in professional interaction. In a writing context, the personal dimension entails the ability to share thoughts, emotions, knowledge, and relevant opinions with literary works (Simonsen & Jensen, 2022). This technique serves as a means to enhance your writing skills.

In the English language, various types of texts are subject to study, such as explanations, descriptions, procedural, and narratives. A narrative text is characterized by a sequence of events logically and chronologically connected, driven, or experienced by various factors. Remarkably, the two approaches, the Genre-Based Approach and the Personal Approach, significantly contribute to the comprehension of narrative texts. This aligns with the findings (Haryanti & Sari, 2019), who stated that the adoption of a genre-based approach serves as a valuable framework. Furthermore, the research conducted by (Guarango, 2022) underscored the effectiveness of the personal approach in altering students' perspectives on writing narrative texts.

Educators in the EFL / ESL context are encouraged to refrain from conventional methodologies when instructing writing. Instead, they should introduce a diverse array of approaches and techniques to instill motivation among their students for writing. (Adas & Bakir, 2013) emphasized that employing traditional teaching methods can render the teaching-learning process passive and monotonous within the classroom environment. Consequently, it is imperative to ascertain the efficacy of both, the Genre-Based Approach and the Personal Approach. This understanding holds significant weight as it enables educators to integrate novel and effective techniques into the classroom environment. There is also potential for synergistic benefits through the strategic incorporation of these two approaches.

A significant body of work in the realm of education, exemplified by studies conducted by (Haryanti & Sari, 2019) in favor of a genre-based approach and by (Guarango, 2022) highlighting the personal approach's effectiveness in narrative writing, has been completed. These investigations have independently established the efficacy of both approaches. However, it is important to note that, thus far, no research has undertaken a comprehensive comparative analysis between these two

approaches. In essence, previous research has primarily concentrated on comparing the genre-based approach with the traditional approach, with limited attention given to the personal approach.

As a result, this research was primarily geared towards conducting an in-depth analysis of the relative efficacy of the genre-based approach and the personal approach in the realm of EFL materials, with a specific focus on the composition of narrative texts. The study was guided by a singular, fundamental research inquiry: Which of these approaches demonstrates the most suitable for practical application in the teaching of narrative writing within the EFL Classroom?

## **Method**

Qualitative research is "a research procedure that produces descriptive data in the form of written or spoken words from people and behaviors that can be observed" Bogdan and Taylor in Moleong (2010:04). Qualitative data collection will analyze the differences between personal approach and genre-based approaches in writing narrative texts from students. The object of this research be conducted by students of SMK YMJ CIPUTAT by using one class, we chose class XI as the research participants. The class will follow a personal approach to narrative text learning and a genre-based approach to writing narrative texts. Data collection, this study will be given to the students of class XI. In the first step, the researcher delivered the treatment with two approaches, a personal approach and a genre-based approach in teaching narrative text writing in the classroom. In the second step, the researcher will give the post-test to the students for further data collection. The third step is the interview, the researcher will interview students regarding written feedback on the two approaches. Finally, the researcher will analyze the results of student work exercises as one of the data collectors. In this study, the researcher obtained 11 participants, but in this study, no pre-test was conducted due to time constraints and to optimize the use of existing tests. Although this study has limitations, it shows that treatment and testing have more positive effects than individualized or genre-based approaches in learning to write narrative texts.

## **Result**

This research was conducted by 11th-grade students of SMK YMJ CIPUTAT with 11 participants. This section presents the findings obtained by the researcher through treatment, post-test, then the students were directed to practice writing about personal experiences & genre genre-based approach along with the narrative structure as described by the researcher in learning to write narrative text, and interviews as further data collection. The following are the findings of the post-test

of students' narrative writing with personal experience and genre-based approach in narrative text learning:

No	Student	Score	
		Personal Approach	Genre-based approach
1.	STD 1	8	9
2.	STD 2	8	9
3.	STD 3	7	6
4.	STD 4	8	9
5.	STD 5	6	7
6.	STD 6	6	6
7.	STD 7	6	6
8.	STD 8	8	9
9.	STD 9	5	6
10.	STD 10	6	6
11.	STD 11	8	9
<b>Result</b>		<b>76</b>	<b>82</b>

Table 1.1 of Posttest result.

Based on the results of the student writing above, it can be seen that the score is 82 for the genre-based approach and the personal approach (experience) gets a score of 76. In writing personal experience & genre-based narrative texts, the researcher frees students to determine the theme they want to take to write narrative texts. In the table above, most of them fulfill the narrative text structure including orientation, complication, and resolution. But what we already know, is that in writing there must be problems in writing narrative text, especially in the structure of narrative text. In the table above, after the treatment, some students got a score of 8 and 9 because they wrote narrative text according to the structure of narrative text, then students who got a Score of 7 only show the results of writing the orientation, complication section without writing the resolution section and then students who have a score of 6 show the orientation section irregularly, while

those who get a score of 5 students only show the meaning and examples of narrative text.

It can be concluded that the results of the post-test above with the overall score of students obtained the highest result of 82 in the genre-based approach in learning narrative text, from these results, it is not enough to answer the previous question, therefore the researcher conducted the interview findings below:

<b>Personal experience</b>	<b>Genre based</b>	<b>Total</b>
2 Students	9 Students	11

*Table 2.2 Interview result*

The interview results show that 2 students stated personal experience as their preference in writing narrative text because they said that "writing based on personal experience we know more about ourselves, we feel, so we understand more in writing". Therefore, these two students chose to write narrative text based on personal experience.

Then the interview results show that 9 students stated genre-based as a preference in writing narrative text, from these 9 students there are different answers among 1 student who stated "I choose and prefer to write genre-based because I am more to us think and more challenged". 8 other students stated the same thing, genre-based is a preference in writing because it is more interesting, and entertaining, and prefers genre-based.

It can be concluded from the data collection, post-test, and interviews above that the genre-based approach is more effective & practical in students' learning in writing narrative texts because this approach teaches students about genres commonly found in daily life and specific contexts. Students learn to recognize the characteristics and structure of each genre such as orientation, complication, and

resolution, as well as how to appropriately structure the text within the genre based on the narrative structure above.

Therefore, from the above analysis and results, to answer the previous research question, it can be concluded again that genre-based writing learning is more effective for students. Based on the interview results, students prefer more genre-based narrative texts, according to them genre-based narrative texts are more interesting and more challenging. This led to an increase in students' writing skill scores in the form of exercises or tests. However, personal experience can provide an alternative writing method that appeals to students. Therefore, the genre-based approach can be used as the main method of writing learning, while personal experience can be used as a complementary method.

### **Discussion**

The following discussion compares genre-based approaches with personal approaches in teaching narrative texts, based on research findings: Based on research findings, genre-based approaches to teaching narrative text writing are contrasted with personalized methods in the following discussion (Silvy P, dan Afanin, 2020). Instead, the personal approach emphasizes people's capacity to communicate their ideas, emotions, expertise, and points of view. With this method, students are encouraged to investigate their thoughts and experiences and utilize them as inspiration for their writing. This method is more adaptable and can be adapted to meet the needs of specific children. Students should, however, have a high level of self-motivation and self-discipline as they bear most of the responsibility for their education. In conclusion, each strategy has its advantages and disadvantages, and the decision between the two should be made keeping in mind the student's unique requirements and circumstances. Combining the two methods in a complementary manner allows for the reduction of their deficiencies while maximizing the strengths of each. Students can benefit from a more comprehensive and successful educational experience as a result Genre-based approach. The teaching approach by genre follows five steps: (1) Building context, (2) Text analysis and modeling (3) Cooperative text construction; (4) Independent text construction; and (5) Genre-based text linking (Wijaya et al., 2020).

Both genre-based and individual approaches to teaching narrative text writing have their advantages and benefits. This is a brief overview of the two methods. The genre-based method places a strong emphasis on teaching specific texts, each with its structure and nature. According to research, students' writing skills can be improved by using a genre-based approach (Marliana & Indihadi, 2020). For example, research conducted at SMA Islam Malahayati Jakarta revealed

Ahmad Sulthan Adil Lillah<sup>1</sup>, M Zayyan Faiz An-nur<sup>2</sup>, Siti Maemunah<sup>3</sup>, Iis Nurul Hasanah<sup>4</sup>,  
Farida Hamid<sup>5</sup>

*Improve students' ability to understand English learning material through a personal approach to students*

that using a genre-based approach improved learning outcomes for students in experimental classes. Individual methods for teaching students how to create narrative texts further emphasize their unique experiences. The experiential learning model that tries to characterize the learning process of writing narrative texts so that the writing ability of students in experimental classes is recognized, is one illustration of the personalization method. (Silvy P, dan Afanin, 2020).

Is a method that applies brainstorming strategies to the learning model of writing narrative texts. Students' writing skills have improved due to this method. However, learning to write narrative texts can also be achieved through the use of genre-based and personal approaches. These methods can also be mixed into practice to get the best possible learning outcomes. It has also been shown that this method works well to help students become better writers. Student learning outcomes improved when brainstorming approaches were used in narrative text-writing learning models, according to the study. The effectiveness of genre-based and individual approaches in teaching writers how to produce narrative texts varies. The learner's specific situation and requirements determine which strategy is best. These methods can also be mixed into practice to get the best possible learning outcomes (Wijaya et al., 2020).

Writing narrative texts is an important component of developing language proficiency for students. Many strategies, such as genre-based and individual approaches, have been presented to improve the quality of writing instruction. In this case, we will investigate how well genre-based techniques and individual approaches work to teach people how to produce narrative texts (Education & Program, 2002). The goal of the genre-based method is to understand a particular type of literature—in this example, narrative text. Before beginning to write, students are encouraged to understand the components, parts, and structure of narrative writing. As a result, the formal and functional features of the genre are given more attention in this learning (Wijaya et al., 2020).

This method makes it possible to integrate reading and listening comprehension with the skills of other languages to understand the genre as a whole. Improved Coherence and Structure, by following the rules of narrative texts, students can hone their skills in creating well-organized and cohesive stories. Alternatively, the personal approach places more emphasis on one's capacity for cognition, feelings, knowledge, and expression of opinions. With this method, students are encouraged to investigate their thoughts and experiences and utilize

them as inspiration for their writing. This method is more adaptable and can be adapted to meet the needs of specific children. Students should, however, have a high level of self-motivation and self-discipline as they bear most of the responsibility for their education. In conclusion, each strategy has its advantages and disadvantages, and the decision between the two should be made keeping in mind the student's unique requirements and circumstances. Combining the two methods in a complementary manner allows for the reduction of their deficiencies while maximizing the strengths of each. Students can benefit from a more comprehensive and successful educational experience as a result (Irawansyah, 2016). Some critics argue that a genre-based approach can limit students' creativity because it focuses too much on specific rules and structures (MGS. A. Gebby Al Muhar, Angginaaken Nurani, and Shafa Amira Fauziah, 2023). A more individualized approach to writing instruction emphasizes the growth of each student's distinct writing voice and expression. The emphasis is on the unique way that concepts and narratives are communicated. Students can explore originality and distinctiveness in their writing style as they create a sense of themselves as writers. Without restrictions on a particular genre, this method allows students to freely explore various concepts, which can foster creativity and innovation (Prasiyanto Cahyono, 2017).

A major criticism of the personal method is its neglect of formal structure, which may make it more difficult for students to produce quality narrative work. It is important to acknowledge that genre-based and personal approaches have advantages and disadvantages when debating how effective they are at teaching people how to produce narrative texts. As a result, the best strategies may change based on the requirements and nature of the learner. A balanced learning environment can be created by combining aspects of both holistic approaches, which will ideally allow students to improve their formal and expressive skills at the same time (Prakoso, 2021).

## **Conclusion**

Students' writing skills are shaped by genre-based and personal methods, according to research on the efficacy of learning approaches to writing narrative texts. While each has its advantages and applications, genre-based solutions seem to offer more advantages than customized options. The genre-based approach provides students with a solid foundation to gain an in-depth understanding of the fundamental principles of story writing by focusing on the overall structure and nature of different narrative genres. Students can determine the characters, story points, and writing styles that underpin narrative literature using this diverse



Ahmad Sulthan Adil Lillah<sup>1</sup>, M Zayyan Faiz An-nur<sup>2</sup>, Siti Maemunah<sup>3</sup>, Iis Nurul Hasanah<sup>4</sup>,  
Farida Hamid<sup>5</sup>

*Improve students' ability to understand English learning material through a personal approach to students*

framework of strategies. As a result, students are better prepared to learn more focused and structured writing techniques.

In addition, genre-based tactics enhance students' creative horizons by instilling a sense of heterogeneity within the narrative framework. By presenting original and thorough examples, students can understand how different styles of writing can be used to evoke specific responses from readers. Students can try new things, develop their writing voice, and broaden their writing horizons with these opportunities. However, examining narrative literature from a human perspective is also interesting. Using this approach, the author's identity is more established and students can examine their personal stories. Students can find their own distinctive voice and writing style as a result, making writing more meaningful and applicable to their writing experience. In this case, achieving a harmonious learning experience may require a balance between genre-based and individual techniques. The creative and structural components of a genre-based approach combined with a focus on individual expression can foster an environment where students can hone their writing skills while remaining engaged and connected to the subject matter.

Therefore, while teaching narrative texts using genre-based methods might provide a solid foundation, adding a personal component can bring an important emotional and creative dimension. In this situation, teachers should look at many approaches to writing instruction as a spectrum and combine the best features of each to give students a well-rounded and satisfying writing education. Thus, although genre-based strategies may be more obvious, individual approaches still contribute greatly to the growth of aspiring writers.

Individual and genre-based instruction should be used to develop students' narrative writing skills. The genre-based approach enhances students' writing skills by giving them a solid foundation in the principles of story writing and promoting diversity in narrative form. By exploring their own life stories and finding their own voice and writing style, students can become authentic writers with the support of a personal approach, which lays a significant focus on this goal. Striking a balance between personal and genre-based approaches—combining the creative and structural elements of a genre-based approach with an emphasis on individual expression—can result in a holistic learning experience.

According to the findings, teachers should view writing instruction as a spectrum and use the benefits of genre-based and individualized approaches to provide students with rich and engaging learning opportunities. Even while genre-based methods can be more visible, a personal approach undoubtedly adds value to the development of budding writers. Future investigations may examine the efficacy of incorporating alternative pedagogical approaches into the instruction of narrative texts. It would also be useful to see how these methods can be modified for use with different age groups and educational environments. In addition, to optimize student engagement and learning outcomes, research might concentrate on how to skillfully combine genre-based and personalized approaches. (Herman et al. 2020).

### **Acknowledgment**

First of all, we would like to thank Prof Didin Nuruddin Hidayat, MA, TESOL, and Mrs Yatni Fatwa Mulyati for being extraordinary, without their blessings this paper would not exist, we thank you again for the knowledge provided and your guidance is one of the most important things in our research, knowledge, knowledge, experience not only enriches our understanding but inspires and explores more.

Then to our supervisors: Mrs Yatni Fatwa Mulyati who is extraordinary we thank you very much for your guidance, direction, and patience in guiding us and the time you gave us during the preparation of our research paper.

Then to the school and teachers: SMK YMJ CIPUTAT South Tangerang, we thank you very much for providing an extraordinary opportunity for us to conduct research at the school, as well as good facilities and support to us in the research process that we conducted.

Finally, we would like to thank each member for their collaboration in the preparation of this research, thanks to each of you for conducting this research until it was completed.

### **References**

- Adas, D., & Bakir, A. (2013). Writing difficulties and new solutions: Blended learning as an approach to improve writing abilities.
- Anggaira, A. S. (2012). Using a genre-based approach to improve the English writing competence of VIIA students of SMPN 3 Metro Lampung in the academic year 2011/2012.
- Cahyono, Setyo Prasiyanto, and Setyo Cahyono. 2020. "The Implementation of Genre Based Approach to Teaching Narrative Listening."

Ahmad Sulthan Adil Lillah<sup>1</sup>, M Zayyan Faiz An-nur<sup>2</sup>, Siti Maemunah<sup>3</sup>, Iis Nurul Hasanah<sup>4</sup>,  
Farida Hamid<sup>5</sup>

*Improve students' ability to understand English learning material through a personal approach to students*

[https://www.academia.edu/36026038/The\\_Implementation\\_of\\_Genre\\_Based\\_Approach\\_to\\_Teaching\\_Narrative\\_Listening](https://www.academia.edu/36026038/The_Implementation_of_Genre_Based_Approach_to_Teaching_Narrative_Listening).

- Fuad, Anis & Sapto Kandung (2013). *Panduan Praktis Penelitian Kualitatif*. Yogyakarta. Graha Ilmu.
- Graham, S., & Perin, D. (2007). *Writing next: Effective strategies to improve writing of adolescents in middle and high schools - A report to Carnegie Corporation of New York*.
- Hermansyah, S. (2022). *Integrating Personal Experience (Pe) Method in Narrative Text: Writing Approach*.
- Haryanti; Sari, F. (2019). *The Use of Genre-Based Approach to Improve Writing Skill In Narrative Text At The Eleventh Grade Students Of Sma Ethika Palembang*.
- Haryanti, Haryanti, and Farnia Sari. 2021. "THE USE OF GENRE-BASED APPROACH TO IMPROVE WRITING SKILL IN NARRATIVE TEXT AT THE ELEVENTH GRADE STUDENTS OF SMA ETHIKA PALEMBANG." *English Community Journal* 3 (1): 280–88. <https://doi.org/10.32502/ECJ.V3I1.1693>.
- Herman, Ridwin Purba, Nguyen Van Thao, and Anita Purba. 2020. "Using Genre-Based Approach to Overcome Students' Difficulties in Writing." *Journal of Education and E-Learning Research* 7 (4): 464–70. <https://doi.org/10.20448/JOURNAL.509.2020.74.464.470>.
- Irawansyah. 2016. "Genre Basic Approach: A Way to Enhance Students'." *Tadris Bahasa Inggris* 9 (1): 74–88.
- Ismayanti, D., Said, Y. R., Usman, N., & Nur, M. I. (2024). *The Students Ability in Translating Newspaper Headlines into English A Case Study*. *IDEAS: Journal on English Language Teaching and Learning, Linguistics and Literature*, 12(1), 108-131.
- Jubhari, Y., Sasabone, L., & Nurliah, N. (2022). *The Effectiveness of Contextual Teaching and Learning Approach in Enhancing Indonesian EFL Secondary Learners' Narrative Writing Skill*. *REiLA: Journal of Research and Innovation in Language*, 4(1), 54-66.
- Marliana, R., & Indihadi, D. (2020). *Brainstorming Techniques in Learning Models for Writing Narrative Texts*.
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, M. A. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: A sourcebook*. SAGE Publications.
- MGS. A. Gebby Al Muhar, -, - Angginaaken Nurani, and - Shafa Amira Fauziah. (2023). "PENERAPAN PENDEKATAN GENRE BASED DALAM KETERAMPILAN

- MENULIS BAHASA ASING : SEBUAH TINJAUAN PUSTAKA,"December.  
<https://e-journal.upr.ac.id/index.php/enggang>.
- Nurvita, M., Silvy, P., & Afanin. (2020). Penerapan Pendekatan Berbasis Genre dalam Pengajaran Menulis Teks
- Pardede, H., & Herman, H. (2020). The effect of numbered heads together method to the students' ability in writing recount text. *Cetta: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 3(2), 291-303.
- Posborg, R. (2009). Personlige kompetencer i socialrådgivning [Personal competencies within social work].
- Prakoso, Gita Hilmi. 2021. "GENRE-BASED APPROACH IN TEACHING WRITING NARRATIVE TEXT: A Case Study Research at One Public Junior High School in Bandung," November.
- Sagiro, S. (2013). Teaching Narrative Texts in English: A Genre-Based Approach. *Journal of Language and Literature Education*.
- Silvy P, dan Afanin, Nurvita, Masitowarni,. 2020. "PENERAPAN PENDEKATAN BERBASIS GENRE DALAM PENGAJARAN MENULIS TEKS PADA SISWA KELAS X SMA SWASTA MULIA." *Bahastra: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra Indonesia* 5 (1): 142-55.  
<https://doi.org/10.30743/BAHASTRA.V5I1.3301>.
- Said, Y. R., & Tabitah, P. N. (2023). The Effectiveness of Speed-Reading Technique in Narrative Text to Improve Students' Reading Ability. *IDEAS: Journal on English Language Teaching and Learning, Linguistics and Literature*, 11(1), 936-947.
- Sugiyono, 2005. *Understanding Qualitative Research*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Tuan, L.T (2011). Teaching writing through a genre-based approach.
- Wijaya, D. F., & Harmayanthi, V. Y. (2020). The Influence of a Genre-Based Approach on Students' Writing Ability.
- Wijaya, Dwi Febriyanti, Vera Yulia Harmayanthi, and Yuliwati. 2020. "Pengaruh Pendekatan Berbasis Genre Terhadap Kemampuan Menulis Siswa." *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Pendidikan STKIP Kusuma Negara II*, 92-98.
- Wijayanti, Siti Fathonah, Joko Nurkamto, and Hefy Sulistyawati. 2020. "Genre-Based Approach: Its Contribution to The Quality of Teaching and Learning Process." *English Education* 6 (2): 136-44.  
<https://doi.org/10.20961/EED.V6I2.35936>.