

The Influence of Human Resources in Improving The Quality of Education Through Training And Career Development of Teachers in Palopo City

Nurul Azisah¹, Ilham Tahier², Muh Yusuf³

^{1,2,3}Muhammadiyah University of Palopo

Email Correspondence Author: nrlazsh22@gmail.com

Abstract

Received: 23 Oktober 2024

Revised: 21 December 2024

Accepted: 30 December 2024

The article titled "The Influence of HRM in Improving Education Quality through Training and Career Development of Educators in Palopo City" aims to analyze the impact of human resource management (HRM) on education quality, particularly through training and career development of educators. This study involved 97 respondents, with data collected using questionnaires. The data were analyzed using multiple linear regression with the assistance of SPSS Statistics 22 software. The findings of the study reveal that: 1. Human resource management has a positive and significant influence on education quality. 2. Training has a positive but not significant influence on education quality. 3. Career development has a positive and significant influence on education quality. 4) simultaneously variable X influences variable Y

Keywords: Human Resources, management, training, career development, quality education

INTRODUCTION

Education is the main pillar in building an advanced national civilization. As a benchmark for a country's progress, the quality of education plays an important role in producing competent human resources, both in terms of intellectual, moral, spiritual, and professional. However, reality shows that the education system in Indonesia still faces various challenges. Various studies show that the quality of education in Indonesia lags far behind neighboring countries, such as Singapore and Malaysia (Asdir 2020). This is a reminder of the importance of the right strategy in improving the quality of education in the country.

One important aspect in improving the quality of education is the management of human resources (HR). In the context of education, HR includes educational personnel who are directly responsible for the learning process. Good management of HR can increase the efficiency and effectiveness of educational personnel, thus having a significant impact on student learning outcomes. Stone and Deadrick (2022) emphasize that effective

HR management includes training and career development, capable of building educational personnel who are not only competent but also motivated to continue to develop.

Palopo City, as one of the centers of education in South Sulawesi, faces challenges in improving the quality of education. Training and career development of educational staff is one of the strategic efforts that are expected to improve the quality of education, training aims to improve the technical and pedagogical skills of teachers, while career development helps create educational staff who have a high vision and spirit of professionalism (McCauley & McClelland, 2020). However, challenges such as budget constraints, program relevance, and evaluation of the impact of training are obstacles that need to be overcome.

Based on this background, this study aims to examine the extent to which human resource management, training and career development of educational staff have an influence on improving the quality of education in the city of Palopo. This study is expected to contribute to education, especially in the aspect of human resource management.

METHODS

Types of research

This study uses a quantitative approach. The quantitative approach is based on the philosophy of positivism and is applied to analyze a particular population or sample. Data collection is carried out using research instruments and analysis is carried out quantitatively with the aim of testing the established hypothesis. In addition, in this study. The type of research used is *ex post facto*, namely research that aims to explore causal relationships without any intervention or treatment provided by the study. This quantitative approach and type of *ex post facto* research were chosen to understand the impact of human resource management on the quality of education through training and development of educators in Palopo City, (Sambudi 2021)

Population and sample

Population is a generalization area consisting of objects that have certain qualities and characteristics determined by researchers to be studied as material for drawing conclusions. Samples are part of the population used for research according to Sugiyono (2017:215). This study uses purposive sampling technique, which is a sampling method based on certain predetermined criteria. This technique is carried out intentionally with the aim of ensuring that the sample is selected according to standards and is able to reflect conditions that are relevant to the research objectives.

To determine the required sample size, the Cochran formula is used (Sugiyono, 2017). The Cochran formula is where:

$$n = \frac{Z^2 p}{e^2}$$

N= number of samples required

Z= The level of confidence required in the sample, namely 95% P= Probability of Correct 50%

q= Probability of Wrong 50%

Moe: Margin of Error or the maximum level of error that can be tolerated.

The confidence level used is 95% secured Z value of 1.96 and maximum error rate of 10%.
 The number of sample sizes in this study is as follows:

$$n = \frac{(1.96)^2 (0.5)(0.5)}{(0.1)^2}$$

n= 96.04

Based on the calculations above, the minimum number of samples that must be used in this study is 97 respondents.

Primary Data and Secondary Data

Primary data, namely, obtained directly from workers or educators in Palopo City by distributing questionnaires/surveys by asking questions and statements that have been prepared in detail and well by distributing questionnaires in all online media, and creating questionnaires with Google form to facilitate researchers and processed through the SPSS Statistics 22 program. While secondary data, data obtained from second sources or sources supporting primary data. Researchers obtain from journals or other online books.

Data Analysis Methods

Validity Test

According to Sugiyono 2018:267 Validity Test is the similarity of data reported by researchers with data obtained directly that occurs in research subjects. Validity test is used to measure the validity or otherwise of a questionnaire. A questionnaire is said to be valid if the statements in the questionnaire are able to reveal what will be measured by the questionnaire.

Reliability Test

Reliability Test is the degree of consistency and stability of data or findings. Unreliable data cannot be processed further because it will produce biased conclusions. A measuring instrument is considered reliable if the measurement shows consistent results over time. (Yusuf 2021)

Multiple Linear Regression Test

(Ghozali (2018) Multiple regression analysis is a method used to assess the influence of several independent variables on one dependent variable. The multiple linear regression model is used to describe how independent variables affect dependent variables. The equation or formula applied in multiple linear analysis is:

$$Y = a + B_1X_1 + B_2X_2 + \dots + B_nX_n + e$$

Information:

Y = dependent variable

a = Constant Coefficient

B₁—B₂ = Regression Coefficient for each independent variable X₁,X₂,...X_n = independent variable

e = Standard Error

Coefficient of Determination (Adjusted R²)

The coefficient of determination essentially assesses how well a model can explain variation in the dependent variable. The coefficient number is in the range of zero to one (0 ≤ R² ≤ 1). A

low R2 indicates that the independent variable has only limited ability to explain changes in the dependent variable. Preferably, a value close to 1 indicates that the independent variable almost completely explains the information needed to predict changes in the dependent variable. (Ghozali, 2018: 97)

Hypothesis Testing t-test

The t-test is basically used to measure the extent to which an independent variable influences changes in the dependent variable. (Ghozali, 2018:98). If the calculated t is smaller than the t table, and the significant probability is greater than 0.05, then the independent variable has no effect on the dependent variable. Conversely. If the calculated t is greater than the t table, and the significant probability is less than 0.05, then the independent variable has an effect on the dependent variable.

f test

The f test basically shows that all independent variables in the model have a similar impact on the dependent variable (Ghozali, 2018:98). If the calculated F value is less than the F table value and the significant probability is more than 0.05, then all independent variables have no effect on the dependent variable. Conversely, if the calculated F value is greater than the F value and the significant probability is less than 0.05, then all independent variables have an effect on the dependent variable.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Research result

Validity and Reliability Test

Validity test where the questionnaire or list of statements and questions becomes the main data that can help the implementation of this research and allows researchers to check whether the tool created can measure the variables that researchers want to evaluate. Therefore, feasibility testing using SPSS and Microsoft Excel is needed. Validity test is made by examining the relationship between each list of statements and the overall score. To determine the r table used, namely $df (N-2) = 97-2 = 95$ using two-way significance with a value of 0.05 so that $r \text{ table} = 0.1996$.

Table 4. Validity Test Results

Variables	indicator	r Titung	r Table	Significant	a	Description
Management Human Resources (X1)	X1.1	0.577	0.1996	0,000	0.05	Valid
	X1.2	0.756				
	X1.3	0.774				
	X1.4	0.830				
	X1.5	0.810				
	X1.6	0.801				
Training (X2)	X2.1	0.737	0.1996	0,000	0.05	Valid
	X2.2	0.845				
	X2.3	0.810				
	X2.4	0.848				

Developmentcareer (X2)	X3.1	0.816	0.1996	0,000	0.05	Valid
	X3.2	0.759				
	X3.3	0.854				
	X3.4	0.822				
	X3.5	0.822				
QualityEducation n (Y)	Y 1	0.844	0.1996	0,000	0.05	Valid
	Y 2	0.845				
	Y 3	0.857				
	Y 4	0.865				
	Y 5	0.778				

Source: processed through SPSS

Based on Table 4, the results of the validity test show that the results of the HR management, training and career development variables on the quality of education have a calculated r value greater than the r table value, so it can be concluded that all statement items are valid.

If the Crombach's alpha value > 0.60, then the variable is reliable.

Table 5. Reliability Test Results.

Variables	Crombach'sAlpha	Standard	Information
Human Resource Management (X1) Training (X2) Career Development (X3) Quality of Education (Y)	0.862	0.60	Reliable
	0.823	0.60	
	0.873	0.60	
	0.893	0.60	

Source: processed through SPSS

Based on table 5. It shows that all variables have a Crombach's alpha value > 0.60 or above 0.60, so it can be concluded that all variables are reliable.

Multiple Linear Regression Results

Table 6. Multiple Linear Regression Results Coefficients

Dependent Variable: totally data source: processed using SPSS

Model	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
1. (Constant)	3,556	1,671		2,128	,036
Human Resource Management Training	,333	,090	,370	3,712	,000
Career Development	,013	,156	,011	,085	,933
	,450	,101	,477	4,437	,000

The results of multiple linear regression analysis show the relationship between HR management

variables, training and career development, therefore the regression equation can be formulated as follows:

$$Y = 3.556 + 0.333X_1 + 0.013X_2 + 0.450X_3 + e$$

The results of the multiple linear regression equation obtained above can be interpreted in several ways, including:

- a. The constant coefficient with a value of 3.556 shows that if the human resource management variables (X1), training (X2), and career development (X3) remain at constant values, then the quality of education (Y) will increase by 3.556%.
- b. The regression coefficient for the human resource management variable (X1) is 0.333. If the value of the other variables is stable and the X1 variable increases by 1%, the quality of education will increase by 3.33%.
- c. The regression coefficient for the training variable (X2) is 0.013. If the value of the other variables is stable and the X2 variable increases by 1%, the quality of education (Y) will increase by 0.13%.
- d. The regression coefficient for the career development variable (X3) is 0.450. If the value of the other variables is kept constant and the X3 variable increases by 1%, then the quality of education (Y) will increase by 4.50%.

Results of the Determination Coefficient Test (R²)

Table 7. Results of the Determination Coefficient Test (R²)

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Standard Error of the Estimate
1	.772 ^a	.596	.583	1.98422

a. Predictors: (Constant), totalX3, totalX1, totalX2

Data source: processed using SPSS

Based on the results of the analysis above, the coefficient of determination (R²) value is obtained as much as 0.596. The magnitude of the quality of the coefficient of determination (R²) figure of 0.596 is equal to 59.6% indicating that the variables of human resource management (X1), training (X2) and career development (X3) have an influence on the quality of education (Y) of 60% or are able to explain the variable (Y) while the remaining 40% is explained by other variables.

t-Test Results

The partial test (t-test) is used to determine whether the independent variables, namely HR Management, Training and Career Development, have an influence individually (individually).

on the quality of Education Quality (Y). if there is a t valuecount is greater than the ttable value,

then there is an influence between the variables

The t table value is obtained by using the formula:

$$df = n - k \quad df = 97 - 4 = 93$$

Where :

n = number of samples k = number of variables

From the calculation results, the df value is 93 with $\alpha = 5\%$ ($0.05/2 = 0.025$) so that the t table value is 1.985.

Table 8 t-Test Results

Variable	t count	t table	Sig
Human Resource Management	3,712	1,985	0.00
Training	0.85	1,985	0.93
Career Development	4,437	1,985	0.00
a Quality of Education			

SPSS 22 data source

Aims to test and measure how high the influence of each variable as a whole is on the following variables:

1. H1 The calculated t value of the Human Resource Management variable is $3.712 > t$ table value = 1.985 with a significance of $0.000 < 0.05$, where H1 is accepted and H0 is rejected. So with Thus, Human Resource Management has a positive influence on the Quality of Education.
2. H2 The calculated t value of the Training variable is $0.085 >$ from the t table value = 1.985 with a significance of $0.933 >$ from 0.05 where H0 accepted and H2 is rejected, thus the hypothesis These two studies did not prove it, which means that there is no significant influence of training on the quality of education.
3. H3 The t-value of the Career Development variable is $4.437 >$ from the t-table value of 1.985 with a significance of $0.000 <$ from 0.05 where H3 is accepted and H0 rejected. So with the discovery Career Development variables have a positive effect on the Quality of Education

f Test Results

This test is conducted to identify the overall influence of variables simultaneously with a significance level of 0.05. If the significance value is less than 0.05 or the calculated F is greater

than the F table, then the variable X has a simultaneous influence on the variable Y. Conversely, if the significance value is greater than 0.05 and the calculated F is less than the F table, then there is no influence of the variable X on the variable Y simultaneously.

Table 9 Test Results f

Model		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	540,094	3	180,031	45,727	.000 ^b
	Residual	366,153	93	3,937		
	Total	906,247	96			

Data sources processed by SPSS

From the f-test result table above, the f value obtained is $45.727 >$ from the F table value of 2.703 and the significant value is $0.000 < 0.05$, where H4 is accepted and H04 is rejected. So all variables have an overall positive influence on the Quality of Education in Palopo City.

Discussion of Research Results

The Influence of Human Resource Management on the Quality of Education in Palopo City

The results of the study indicate that human resource management (HR) has a positive and significant influence on the quality of education in Palopo City. This is evidenced by the t-value of 3.712 which is greater than the t-table (1.985), and the significance value of 0.000 which is smaller than 0.05. This finding confirms that the better the quality of HR management, the higher the quality of education that can be achieved. This finding is in line with Ika Dewi Rahmawati's research. Effective HR management, such as selective recruitment, targeted training, and continuous evaluation, can increase the motivation and competence of educators. Thus, educational institutions need to pay more attention to HR management as the main strategy in improving the quality of education.

The influence of training on the quality of education in Palopo City

The analysis shows that training has a positive but insignificant effect on the quality of education, with a t-value of 0.085 which is smaller than the t-table (1.985) and a significance value of 0.933 which is greater than 0.05. This shows that the training currently being carried out has not been able to provide a significant impact on the quality of education. This finding is in line with previous research by Tangdigiling (2018). Where the low effectiveness of training can be

caused by the lack of relevance of training materials to the needs of educators or a less than optimal training approach. Therefore, it is important for educational institutions to design training programs that are appropriate to the specific needs of teachers, such as hands-on practice-based training that is relevant to daily teaching challenges.

The Influence of Teacher Career Development on the Quality of Education in Palopo City

Career development has been proven to have a positive and significant influence on the quality of education, with a t-value of 4.437 which is greater than the t-table (1.985) and a significance value of 0.000. This finding indicates that educators who get career development opportunities, such as promotions and further training, tend to have better motivation and ability to improve the quality of learning. This finding is in line with Wildasari's research (2018). Career development must be part of a strategic educational institution policy. Support in the form of advanced study scholarships, leadership training, or technical competency development can motivate educators to continue to innovate and contribute to improving the quality of education.

The Influence of Human Resource Management, Training and Career Development of Educators on the Quality of Education

The results of the F test show that simultaneously, the variables of HR management, training, and career development have a positive and significant influence on the quality of education, with a calculated F value of 45.727 which is greater than the F table (2.703) and a significance value of 0.000. The coefficient of determination (R^2) value of 59.6% indicates that these three variables together are able to explain more than half of the variability in the quality of education. The combination of good HR management, relevant training, and continuous career development is the key to creating a superior educational environment. Educational institutions need to ensure that all these aspects are integrated into strategic planning for optimal results.

CONCLUSION

Based on the research analysis, the testing and discussion of the hypothesis can lead to the following conclusions:

1. Human resource management (HRM) and career development have a positive and significant influence on the quality of education in Palopo City, while training does not have a significant influence.
2. Simultaneously, HR, training, and career development contributed 59.6% to improving the quality of education, with 40.4% influenced by other factors outside this study.

REFERENCE

- Afandi, P. (2018). Human Resource Management (Theory, Concept and Indicator). Riau: Zanafa Publishing.
- Amiruddin, R., Abdullah, M. R., & Noor Bakri, A. (2025). The Influence of e-WOM, Fashion Trends, and Income on the Consumption Style of the Muslim Community in Palopo City: A Quantitative Analysis. *El-Qist: Journal of Islamic Economics and Business (JIEB)*, 14(2), 185–205. <https://doi.org/10.15642/elqist.2024.14.2.185-204>
- Anwar Prabu Mangkunegara. 2017. "Job Training Indicators." (15):6–27. Arikunto, S. 2017. "Research Methodology." 42–52.
- Arcaro, S Joremo, Quality Based Education, Principles of Formulation and Implementation Procedures, Jakarta: Riene Cipta, 2005, p.85
- Armstrong, M. (2020). Human Resource Management Practice: Improving Organizational Performance. Kogan Page.
- Arno, A., & Mujahidin, M. (2024). Enhancing Zakat Management: The Role of Monitoring and Evaluation in the Amil Zakat Agency. *Jurnal Economia*, 20(3), 397-418. doi:<https://doi.org/10.21831/economia.v20i3.53521>
- ARTAMEVIAH, RESTI. 2022. "Analysis of the Influence of Training, Work Discipline, and Job Satisfaction on the Performance of Bank Mandiri Employees, Jakarta Cikini Branch Office." Analysis of the Influence of Training, Work Discipline, and Job Satisfaction on the Performance of Bank Mandiri Employees, Jakarta Cikini Branch Office Office 12(2004):6–25.
- Asdir. 2020. "In Improving Teacher Performance in Junior High Schools, Islamic Education Management Study Program, Faculty of Tarbiyah and Teacher Training, State Islamic Institute (Iain
- Baso Intang Sappaile, Ex-Post Facto Research Concept, *Journal of Mathematics Education* Vol. 1 No. 2 July 2010, Page 105
- Cengage Learning.
- Dessler, G. (2022). Human Resource Management. Pearson Education.
- Edy Sustrisno. 2009:63. nd "Education and Training." 1–23. Ghozali. 2021. "Multiple Linear Regression Test." STEI Repository 28–38.
- Fiqran, M., Mujahidin, M., Bakri, A. N., & Abdulrahman, A. J. A. (2024). Motivation for Waqf in Millennials and Generation Z: Highlighting Religiosity, Literacy and Accessibility. *IKONOMIKA*, 9(2), 309-332.

- Gutiérrez, M., Pérez, C., & Ramírez, J. (2019). The Impact of Teacher Training on Educational Quality: A Review of Global Experiences. *Educational Management Review*, 23(1), 45-60.
- Hasanuddin, Hasanuddin, As'ad Isma, and Jamrizal Jamrizal. 2023. "The Influence of Human Resources, Expenditure, Operations and Investment on the Quality of Education in Islamic Educational Institutions." *Journal of Educational Management and Social Sciences* 4(2):616–24. doi: 10.38035/jmpis.v4i2.1586.
- Hasibuan, Malayu SP (2017). *Human Resource Management*. Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara. Ginting, Surya. (2016). *Training and Development of Educators*. Jakarta: PT
- Ishak, I., Putri, Q. A. R., & Sarijuddin, P. (2024). Halal Product Assurance at Traditional Markets in Luwu Raya Based on Halal Supply Chain Traceability. *Amwaluna: Jurnal Ekonomi dan Keuangan Syariah*, 8(2), 224-240.
- K, A. ., Astuti, A. R. T. ., & ., Mujahidin. (2024). The Impact of Word of Mouth and Customer Satisfaction on Purchase Decisions: The Role of Maslahah as an Intervening Variable in the Cosmetic Products Industry in Indonesia. *Journal of Ecohumanism*, 3(7), 1525–1540. <https://doi.org/10.62754/joe.v3i7.4307>
- Khairul aAzan, Ali M. Zebua. 2021. *Human Resource Management Theoretical and Practical Studies in Education*.
- Majid, N. H. A., Omar, A. M., & Busry, L. H., Mujahidin Reviving Waqf In Higher Education Institutions: A Comparative Review Of Selected Countries. *European Proceedings of Social and Behavioural Sciences*.
- Mathis, R.L., & Jackson, J.H. (2019). *Human Resource Management: Essential Perspectives*.
- Mauliddiyah, Nurul L. 2021. "THE ROLE OF HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT IN IMPROVING SCHOOL QUALITY AT SMPN 2 PAREPARE
- McCauley, C. D., & McClelland, S. (2020). Leadership Development in Education: Linking Professional Development to Teacher Outcomes. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 31(4), 513-531.
- Meilany, R., Fasiha, F., & Moalla, M. (2025). The Role of Interest as a Mediator in The Relationship of Knowledge and Islamic Financial Inclusion to The Loyalty Costumers of Non-Muslim. *IKONOMIKA*, 10(1), 1-24.
- Mujahidin, Rahmadani, N., & Putri, Q. A. R. (2024). Analysis of the Influence of Religiosity Values In Reducing Consumptive Behavior in Indonesian Muslim Consumers. *Amwaluna: Jurnal Ekonomi dan Keuangan Syariah*, 8(2), 253-274.
- Mukhtar, and Hafzi Ali. 2015. "Development of Teaching Staff." (1980).
- Mulyadi, Deddy. (2015). *Human Resource Training and Development*. Jakarta: Salemba Empat.m

- Pharmacognosy Magazine 75(17):399–405.
- Putri, Ayu Dwi Kesuma, and Nani Imaniyati. 2017. “Teacher Professional Development in Improving Teacher Performance.” *Journal of Office Management Education* 2(2):93. doi: 10.17509/jpm.v2i2.8109.
- Rahmat, A. Syech, Ilham Tahier, and Duriani Duriani. 2024. “The Effect of Compensation and Career Development on Employee Retention at Perumda Air Minum Tirta Latimojong (Pamtl) Luwu Regency.” *SCIENTIFIC JOURNAL OF REFLECTION: Economic, Accounting, Management and Business* 7(3):726–38. doi: 10.37481/sjr.v7i3.895.
- RajaGrafindo Persada.
- Ristianah, N. 2021. “The Concept of Developing Teacher Competencies.” *Journal of Islamic Education Management* 5(1):50–64.
- Rohman, Zairur and M. Ihvan K. 2019. “Strategy for Improving the Quality of Education Based on Total Quality Management (TQM) at Mtsn 5 Kediri.” *E-Theses IAIN Kediri* 13–35.
- Rusman, Curriculum Management, Jakarta: Raja Wali Press, 2009, p. 555
- Sambudi, Lutfi. 2021. “THE INFLUENCE OF HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT ON IMPROVING THE QUALITY OF EDUCATION IN THE EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION INSTITUTION OF AL-QUR'AN (PAUD-Q) KARANGPLOSO MALANG.”
- Sapsuha, M. U., Alwi, Z., Sakka, A. R., & Al-Ayyubi, M. S. (2024). Review of Gold Trading Practices on Credit (non-Cash) Based on Hadith. *Al-Kharaj: Journal of Islamic Economic and Business*, 6(3).
- Simamora, Henry. (2019). *The Influence of Human Resource Management on the Quality of Education*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Stone, D. L., & Deadrick, D. L. (2022). *Human Resource Management: Gaining a Competitive Advantage* (12th ed.). McGraw-Hill Education.
- Suderajat, Hari. 2005. “School-Based Quality Improvement Management; Improving the Quality of Education Through the Implementation of KBK.” *UIN Suska Riau* 10–47.
- Sugiyono. (2017). *Quantitative, Qualitative, and R&D Research Methods*. Alfabeta. Alfabeta, 2012), p. 106 36 Op.cit, Sugiyono, p. 402 37 Faculty of Islamic Education and
- Sugiyono. (2018). *Questionnaire and Questionnaire*. 15(2), 1–23.
- Suryana, Asep. (2018). *Human Resource Management in Education*. Bandung: PT Refika Aditama.
- Tangdigiling, Mirwati. 2018. “The Effect of Training and Work Motivation on Nurse Performance at At-Medika Hospital, Palopo City by.” *Management Study Program, Muhammadiyah University of Palopo* 1–5.

UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang Teaching, Work Guidelines

Wildasari. 2018. "Development of Teaching and Educational Staff Systems." 2(2):37–48.

Wulandari, S., Irfan, A., Zakaria, N. B., & Mujahidin. (2024). Survey Study on Fraud Prevention Disclosure Measurement at State Islamic Universities in Indonesia. *IQTISHODUNA: Jurnal Ekonomi Islam*, 13(1), 327–348. <https://doi.org/10.54471/iqtishoduna.v13i1.2305>

Yusuf, Fahira Muhammad. 2021. "The Influence of Product Quality, Celebrity Endorser and Brand Image on Skin Care Purchasing Decisions at Ms Glow Beauty Clinic Bekasi." *Research Methods* 32–41