



## A study on Relative Clause in English, Indonesian and Arabic Language: A Comparative Analysis

Dharmawati<sup>1</sup>, Mulyadi<sup>2</sup>

Mulyadi.usu@gmail.com

<sup>1,2</sup> Faculty of Cultural Sciences, University of Sumatra Utara, Medan, Indonesia

### Abstract

The research is conducted to an analysis on relative clause in three languages. The aim of this paper is to compare of relative clause in three languages, namely Indonesian, English and Arabic. The research stage in analyzing the data was data collection, data classifying, data presenting. The result of the research is similarities and differences in the structure of relative clause in English, Indonesian and Arabic. Types of relative clause in English are defining and non-defining clauses, types of relative clause in Indonesian are Restrictive and Non-Restrictive relative clause and types of relative clause in Arabic are definite and indefinite relative clause.

**Keywords:** Relative Clause, Language, Comparative Analysis

### Introduction

Contrastive analysis is an analysis in which the structures of two or more languages are compared. It is the systematic study of languages with a view to analyze their structural differences and similarities. Kridalaksana (1983: 118) defines that the clause is a grammatical units in the form of a group of words which at least consists of subject and predicate and has the potential to be a sentence. Various clauses can be seen from the relationship grammatical so that there exists a main clause and a subordinate clause. A clause is a group of words. It is part of a sentence containing a subject and predicate. The Sentence may have one or more clauses.

According to Naibaho (2001: 1) "Contrastive linguistics does not hold only contrastive analysis, but error analysis, and interference analysis". In other words, it can be said that there are 3 ways in conducting language analysis namely contrastive analysis, error analysis, and interference analysis. Each of analysis can be applied in accordance with their function each one. In this study, the contrastive analysis just focuses on finding the similarities and differences of relative. clause of languages compared.

In English, there are two clauses, namely dependent clause and independent clause. A dependent clause is not a complete sentence because it cannot stand alone as a sentence. It must be connected to an independent clause. An independent clause is a complete sentence. It contains the main subject and

verb of a sentence. It also called a main clause. Relative clause in English, Indonesian and Arabic are different.

Relative Clause is one of the subject that has gained much attention in learning language. A relative clause is in nature an embedded sentence modifying a noun in a matrix sentence. Further, Azar (1999) divides relative clause into two types, the first is relative pronoun that is used to connect dependent clause to independent clause. It includes who, whom, which, that, and whose. And the second type is relative adverb that includes where and when. Where is used to modify a place and when is used to modify a noun of time.

First Example:

1. We met a friendly girl

Adjective + noun

2. She is a friendly to everybody

The result from two sentences is:

We met a girl who: main clause relative pronoun

is very friendly to everybody: subordinate clause

So, who is very friendly to everybody explains the girl meant by the speakers. As the classifications of the sentence are:

We met a friendly girl as independent clause or is called main clause.

We as the subject and met as a predicate.

A as an article and friendly as adjective.

Girl as object

She is friendly to everybody as dependent clause or is called subordinate clause.

From the explanation above, it can be concluded that adjective clause is a clause which describes noun or pronoun that uses relative pronoun or relative adverbs.

Second example:

1. The small town (where) I was born has grown to a modern town
2. I remember my twentieth birthday. It was the day (when) the tsunami happened.

Based on the explanation above, it can be concluded that *When* can be used with times and *where* with places to make it clear which time or place we are talking about.

Some relevant studies about a comparative Analysis of relative clause have been done before such as Robert (1970) wrote about the relative clause in three languages. He contrasts the restrictive relative clause in English, Hindi, and Baghdad Arabic and points out differences in emphasis when teaching the English restrictive relative clause to these two kinds of speakers. Dalilan and Mulyono (2004) conducted in English and Indonesian Relative Clause. It involves Indonesian concerns with the relative clause strategy applied by both languages. In the relativization of an NP, English applies the word order strategy which tends to using active sentence pattern. In Indonesian, on the other hand, applies the verb marking strategy which tends to using passive sentence pattern marked by a prefix di-attached to the verb. Rosmita and Mulyadi (2019) found that Indonesian relative clause of Bahasa Indonesia known as *yang* is typical and different from the structured English counterparts. In the meantime, there is a tendency that

Javanese always uses construction passive to relativize noun phrases or nouns in complex sentences.

There are some relevant studies with this research which come from different setting. Based on the explanation above, this study focuses on finding the similarities and differences of relative clause of English, Indonesian and Arabic. The aim of this study is to describe similarities and differences in the construction of English, Indonesian and Arab relative clause.

## Method →

In conducting this research, the paper used a qualitative descriptive. The descriptive method is applied because the data analysis of this research is presented descriptively as Bogdan and Biklen (1982) stated that qualitative research is descriptive which the data is collected in the form of words or pictures rather than numbers. The object was journals related to relative clause in English, Indonesian and Arabic. The research stage in analyzing the data was carried out in four steps. First, is data collection, data will be collected from some sources, Second, data classifying, it makes easier for the researcher to analyze the existing data. Then the last step, data presenting by containing theories from experts and presenting the results obtained in the discussion.

## Results

### 1. Relative Clause in English

A relative clause in English is introduced by using a relative pronoun who, whom, which, that or whose or by a relative adverb where, when or why. There are two types of relative clause in English. They are:

#### a. Defining Relative Clause

Defining relative clauses are also called by identifying relative clauses. It give detailed information defining a general term or expression. Defining relative clauses are not put in commas.

#### Data 1

- *The boy who answered my question was Kaka.*
- *The magazine which you lent me was very Interesting.*
- *I gave a tip to the waiter who serve us.*

In these sentences, the relative clause is an important part of the idea. they show *which* Kaka of a number of boys, *which* magazine of thousands of magazine, *which* porter of several porters.

So this type of clauses are called by Definite clauses.

#### b. Non-defining Relative Clause

Non-defining relative clauses are also called by non-identifying relative clauses or nonrestrictive relative clauses. They give additional information on something but do not define it. Non-defining relative clauses are put in commas.

#### Data 2

- *The woman, who is standing there, is a teacher.*
- *Jamilah, who submit the article, was born in 1988.*

The relative clause in these examples are put in comas because they give extra information and also it can be deleted without changing the meaning. And the new sentence will be *the woman is a teacher and Jamilah was born in 1988*.

## 2. Relative Clause in Indonesian

A relative clause in Indonesian is a subordinative clause which is attributive in nature. Attributive subordination (embed) relationship is realized with a noun phrase that will drive an expansion of one of dependent elements as antecedent. That is, as a subordinative clause, the relative clause is in charge of describing it and/ or modify the meaning expressed in Antecedent. Relative clauses in Indonesian is divided into two, namely:

### a. Restrictive relative clause

Restrictive relative clauses give information that defines the noun, it modifies noun. The information is necessary to complete identification of the noun. Use “that” or “which” for non-human nouns; use “that” or “who” for human nouns and comma isn’t needed.

#### Data 3

*The Students whose grades are high can pass the examination*  
*Siswa-siswa yang nilainya tinggi dapat lulus ujian.*

When a noun becomes the object of a preposition, the noun and its preposition are moved in front of relative clause.

### b. Non-Restrictive relative clause

A non-restrictive relative clause modifies a single noun, a noun phrase, or an entire proposition. It merely provides extra information. “That” cannot be used as a relative pronoun in a non-restrictive relative clause and commas are always used at the beginning and end of this type of relative clause.

#### Data 4

I’m planning to build a house. I design house quite big.

(Saya sedang merencanakan membangun sebuah rumah. Saya mendisain rumah cukup indah).

This sentence become

I’m planning to build a house, **which** I design quite big.

## 3. Relative Clause in Arabic

Relative clause in Arabic is a dependent clause which is introduced by a relative pronoun such as /əɫəði/= *who, which, that* or *whose*, /əɫəti/= *who, which, that* or *whose*, etc. There are also some types of relative clauses in Arabic language, they are:

### a. Definite Relative Clause

Definite relative clause defines as a clause which indicates back to a definite antecedent uses the definite relative pronouns. The definite relative clause is dependent or subordinate, it cannot stand alone. It describes the definite antecedent in the independent clause. In Arabic, the independent clause which includes the antecedent before the dependent clause.

#### Data 5

يقف الرجال هناك بذكاء (yaqif alrijal hunak bidhaka')

The man who is standing there smart  
Translation= The man who is standing there is smart  
This sentence can be divided into two, they are:  
The man is standing  
The man is smart

#### b. Indefinite Relative Clause

An indefinite relative clause in Arabic is an indefinite antecedent. It is a clause which refers to an indefinite noun or noun phrase in the main clause, in which case the relative pronoun is omitted. The indefinite relative clause follows the main clause without any relative pronoun linking them.

#### Data 6

هو رجلٌ يعمل في مكتبة

He is a man who works in the library

In this sentence, “a man” is indefinite. The word “who” is a relative pronoun and refers to “a man”.

In the Arabic, there is no word for “who” because the antecedent, رجل is indefinite.

Relative clauses in Arabic, there are two types of relative clause in Arabic, namely definite and non-definite. Definite relative clause modifies a definite antecedent whereas non definite relative clause modifies a non-definite antecedent. There are eight essential relative pronouns in Arabic.

#### Discussion

The process of contrastive analysis work is done by comparing some aspects of language in three languages (English, Indonesian and Arabic). According to Halliday (1970) describes that the contrastive analysis has two principles. The first is the examination level. The examination level is the observation level, the explanation of a case in a certain language. The second level is comparing certain patterns or certain aspects in a language. In this way, it doesn't compare as a whole like in the first principle addressed or expressed how the process of language works and focus on aspects to be compared. In the process of contrastive analysis, a explanation of the focus or aspects of the language to be compared is performed. If it is described two focus or two aspects of the language part of the three languages certainly understanding the three languages is needed. In the second principle, it is has been stated that what is compared is only one aspect or focus of language. It means that It can't be compared to three languages as a whole. In doing this study, the aspects of relative clauses in English, Indonesian and Arabic languages will be discussed. Because typologies and linguistic properties differ even in the relative focus of clauses, and not all parts of relative clauses can be compared.

Based on the explanations and data that have been stated, it is concluded that Relative Clauses is an element that interjects to other parts in complex sentences. Such relative clauses can be found in English Indonesian and Arabic language.

English, Indonesian and Arabic language has complex relative clauses. Based on the explanation above, we can analyze that the findings of comparative analysis from relative clause in English, Indonesian and Arabic can be concluded as seen on the table

below:

**Table 1. Comparison languages**

<b>Notes</b>	<b>English</b>	<b>Indonesian</b>	<b>Arabic</b>
Relative clause modifies the antecedent	Yes	Yes	Yes
Type of Relative clause	Defining Non-Defining	Restrictive Non- Restrictive	Definite Indefinite
Relative Pronoun	Yes	Yes	Yes (Omitted)
Who, whom, which, whose and that	Relative Pronoun	Konjungsi	Connected
Relative Pronoun	5	1	8
Gender	Agree	Agree	Do not Agree
Possessive relative pronoun	Yes	NO	No
Object	Can be ometted	Can be ometted	Can't be ometted
Relative Clause	Simple	Simple	Complecated
Relative adverbs which can be used to refer to place, time and	Yes	Yes	No
The use of Comma in non-defining relative clauses	Yes	Yes	No

Base on the comparison table above, it can be concluded that there are similarities and differences in the structure of relative clause in English, Indonesian and Arabic. But English and Indonesian are easier than Arabic in using relative clause.

### **Conclusion**

Relative clauses can be found in English, Indonesian and also Arabic. Among these three languages Arabic is more complex in using relative clause. Types of relative clause in English are defining and non-defining clauses, types of relative clause in Indonesian are Restrictive and Non-Restrictive relative clause and types of relative clause in Arabic are definite and indefinite relative clause. There are some similarities and also differences of relative clause in the structure of English, Indonesian and Arabic.

### **Acknowledgement**

The writer thanks goes to Dr. Mulyadi, M.Hum as the writer's lecturer who has guided the writer in finishing this study. Thanks also to my best friend, Jamilah Lubis who had helped the writer to collect the data.

## References

- Allen Asimwe. (2019). The syntax of relative clause constructions in Runyankore-Rukiga: A typological perspective. *Stellenbosch Papers in Linguistics Plus*, Vol. 58, 2019, 131-154
- Alotaibi, Abdullah M. (2016). Examining The Learnability Of English Relative Clauses: Evidence From Kuwaiti EFL Learners. *Canadian Center Of Science And Education*, 9 (2): 57-65.
- Asri. (2020). Relative Clauses and Their Implication For Students' And Teachers' Gramatical Awareness. *PEOPLE: International Journal of Social Sciences*, 6(1), 449-455.
- Azar, Betty Schramper. (1999). *Understanding and Using English Grammar*. USA: Pearson Education
- Bogdan, Robert C. dan Biklen Kopp Sari. (1982). *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theory and Methods*. Allyn and Bacon, Inc.: Boston London.
- Dalilan dan Mulyono. (2004). Klausula relatif bahasa inggris dan bahasa indonesia: analisis kontrastif strategi perelatifan, fungsi, dan karakteristik alat perelatif. *Jurnal Humanika*, Vol XVII, No 3.
- Kridalaksana, H. (2008). *Dictionary of Linguistics*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Robert, P. F. (1970). The Relative Clause in Three Languages. *TESOL Quarterly* Vol. 4, No. 2, pp. 131-136.
- Rosmita A & Mulyadi. (2019). Relative Clause of Indonesian and Java Language. *Scholars International Journal of Linguistics and Literature*, Vol 2, No 5, pp : 85-89.