



کنزل

JOURNAL OF INDONESIAN ISLAMIC STUDIES

<https://ejournal.iainpalopo.ac.id/index.php/jiis/>

## Adaptive Moderation in Islamic Education: A Study of NU Teachers in Muhammadiyah-Affiliated Schools

Winda Islamitha Nurhamidah<sup>1</sup>✉, Muqowim<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup>Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia

### Articles

#### Information

##### History:

Received: Maret

Approved: April

Publish: April

*Keywords: Adaptive Moderation; Islamic Education; Muhammadiyah; NU; Teacher Perspective*

### Abstract

This study investigates how religious moderation is practiced as an adaptive process by Islamic Education (PAI) teachers affiliated with Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) working in a Muhammadiyah-based primary school. It addresses a gap in existing studies that largely emphasize normative and policy-oriented perspectives of moderation, while paying limited attention to teachers' lived experiences, identity negotiation, and pedagogical practices in cross-traditional educational settings. A qualitative case study was conducted at SD Muhammadiyah 2 Samarinda from March to April 2026, involving three purposively selected PAI teachers. Data were collected through direct observation, semi-structured online interviews via Zoom, and documentation, and analyzed using an interactive model combined with thematic coding. The findings reveal that teachers' religious understanding is grounded in the Qur'an and Hadith, accompanied by selective acceptance of intra-Islamic differences within the domain of *furū'iyah*. Social interaction with non-Muslims is allowed within worldly affairs, while clear theological boundaries are maintained. Moderation is understood as a balanced stance that integrates doctrinal commitment with social tolerance. In classroom practice, moderation is implemented through the integration of theological instruction and values of respect, supported by exemplification of prophetic conduct. Teachers also demonstrate the ability to maintain their NU-based identity while adapting to the Muhammadiyah institutional environment. These findings indicate that religious moderation operates as a context-dependent and dynamic process shaped by textual commitment, social interaction, and pedagogical strategies, conceptualized in this study as "adaptive moderation," contributing to a more practice-oriented understanding of moderation in Islamic education.

✉ Email Correspondent:  
[islamithawinda@gmail.com](mailto:islamithawinda@gmail.com)

## **Introduction**

The internal diversity within the Muslim community in Indonesia, particularly between Nahdlatul Ulama and Muhammadiyah, is a socio-religious reality that is not only structural in nature but also manifests in educational practice. Differences in theological, methodological, and religious practices often give rise to complex dynamics, especially when these two traditions intersect within a single institutional setting such as a school. In this context, Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teachers do not merely serve as content deliverers but also as agents who manage differences and shape students' religious orientations. However, some previous studies have tended to view the teacher's role normatively as an agent of moderation, without deeply examining how the teacher's own religious identity influences moderation practices in cross-tradition situations (Rahiem, 2025). This indicates that the practical dimensions and subjective experiences of teachers have yet to be critically explored.

In recent years, the concept of religious moderation has become a dominant discourse in Indonesia's education policy, particularly through programs by the Ministry of Religious Affairs that emphasize the importance of the *wasathiyah* approach as the foundation for a harmonious religious life (Keagamaan, 2019). Religious moderation is positioned as a solution to the potential for radicalism and as a strategy for fostering tolerance in a pluralistic society. However, much of the research examining religious moderation remains focused on conceptual and normative levels, such as definitions, values, and its urgency in education (Ardiansyah & Erihadiana, 2022; Nasir & Rijal, 2021). This approach tends to assume that moderation can be internalized linearly through curricula and policies, without considering the complexity of practices on the ground that involve differences in identity, experience, and social context (Bianda et al., 2026).

A number of empirical studies have indeed begun to focus on the practice of religious moderation in social and educational contexts. The study by Khasanah et al. (2023) emphasizes the importance of an inclusive approach in learning to foster tolerance, but does not explain how teachers manage differences stemming from diverse religious backgrounds (Khasanah et al., 2023). Research by Dewantoro et al. (2026) and Qorib & Umiarso (2025) indicates shared values of moderation between NU and Muhammadiyah, yet places greater emphasis on ideological commonality rather than daily classroom practices (Dewantoro et al., 2026; Qorib & Umiarso, 2025). Meanwhile, the study by Partono et al. (2025) reveals that religious moderation involves a process of identity negotiation, but the context remains limited to the university environment, not elementary education (Partono et al., 2025). Thus, although the existing literature has acknowledged the importance of moderation and cross-identity interactions, most studies have yet to address the micro-praxis dimension within a pedagogical context.

Furthermore, other studies examining religious moderation in society tend to describe practices of tolerance as a form of harmonious social cooperation (Firmansyah et al., 2025), or as the result of processes of adaptation and acculturation within communities (Syamsuddin et al., 2025). However, such approaches often generalize the practice of moderation as something stable and uniform, without revealing the tensions, boundaries, and negotiations that may occur in actual practice. In the context of education, particularly in cross-identity interactions such as those between NU and Muhammadiyah,

religious moderation is not only related to values but also to how individuals simultaneously manage identity, religious authority, and pedagogical practices.

Based on this review, there is a clear research gap. First, most studies still frame religious moderation at the normative and policy levels, rather than in concrete classroom practices. Second, research on the relationship between NU and Muhammadiyah tends to be macro-level (historical and ideological) and has not yet extensively examined micro-level dynamics within the context of formal education. Third, studies that specifically link teachers' religious identities, social adaptation processes, and pedagogical strategies for managing differences remain very limited. These gaps highlight the need for a more contextual and experience-based approach to understanding religious moderation as a tangible social practice.

Given this gap, this study aims to analyze how Islamic Education teachers with a NU background understand and practice religious moderation in Muhammadiyah-affiliated schools, how the processes of adaptation and negotiation of religious identity unfold, and how the value of moderation is implemented in the classroom. This study offers a novel contribution through the development of the concept of “adaptive moderation,” an approach that views religious moderation not merely as a norm or value, but as a dynamic process involving the adaptation, negotiation, and integration of religious identity within specific social and pedagogical contexts. Thus, this study is expected to enrich the study of religious moderation in Islamic education by presenting a more contextual, empirical, and practice-based perspective.

## **Method**

This study employs a qualitative approach using a case study design to gain an in-depth understanding of the practice of religious moderation as a form of adaptation by teachers with a Nahdlatul Ulama background in Muhammadiyah-affiliated schools. This design was chosen because it allows for the exploration of phenomena in a contextual, holistic, and subject-experience-based manner, making it suitable for addressing the research focus that emphasizes social-religious processes and dynamics in education (John W. Creswell, 2016). The research was conducted at SD Muhammadiyah 2 Samarinda during the period of March–April 2026, which was selected because it represents the context of cross-religious identity interactions within formal educational institutions.

The research subjects consisted of three Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teachers with a NU background who teach at the school. Subjects were selected using purposive sampling based on the following criteria: (1) active IRE teachers, (2) having a NU religious background, and (3) having teaching experience in a Muhammadiyah setting. The limited number of subjects (three informants) was deemed sufficient for a qualitative case study, as this research focused on data depth rather than breadth, and allowed for an intensive exploration of the experiences and meanings constructed by the informants (John W. Creswell, 2016; Sugiyono, 2020). Furthermore, this number meets the principle of data saturation, wherein the information obtained reveals recurring and consistent patterns.

Data collection was conducted through observation, in-depth interviews, and documentation. Observations were conducted directly within the school environment to obtain a contextual understanding of institutional culture, social interactions, and learning practices. Interviews were conducted online via the Zoom platform using a semi-structured

format, allowing for flexible yet focused data exploration. The use of online interviews is considered valid in qualitative research as long as they are conducted systematically and maintain the depth of interaction (Archibald et al., 2019). Documentation was used as supporting data, including learning materials, school policies, and other relevant records.

The research instrument consists of an interview guide developed based on the research focus, covering aspects of understanding religious moderation, identity adaptation and negotiation, pedagogical strategies, and the limits of tolerance in religious practice. The data collected consists of interview transcripts, observation notes, and documents. Data validity is ensured through triangulation of methods and sources, as well as member checking to verify consistency between the collected data and the informants' experiences (Meydan & Akkaş, 2024).

Data analysis was conducted using an interactive model comprising three main stages: data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions (Miles et al., 2020). Operationally, the analysis process began with the transcription of interview data, followed by open coding to identify units of meaning. Next, axial coding is performed to group the data into thematic categories such as adaptive moderation, identity negotiation, and pedagogical practices. The subsequent stage is selective coding to identify relationships between categories and formulate key patterns. The categorized data is then presented in the form of descriptive narratives and thematic tables to facilitate interpretation. The analysis process was conducted iteratively and repeatedly until consistent and credible conclusions were reached. This procedure was systematically designed to allow for replication in similar research contexts.

## **Results**

The interview results indicate that the informants' religious understanding is based primarily on the Qur'an and the hadith. All three informants stated that Islamic teachings are fixed and must be based on clear evidence. They emphasized that religious practices must be grounded in these sources. Other references used in understanding religion include books by scholars, sermons by religious teachers, and da'wah media considered consistent with the Qur'an and Sunnah (Nasir & Rijal, 2021).

In the context of internal differences within Islam, the informants stated that differences in madhhabs regarding matters of *fiqh* are acceptable as long as they are based on textual evidence. They noted that such differences do not pose an obstacle to social or professional interactions. However, the informants noted that there are certain religious practices they do not follow if they are deemed to lack a clear textual basis. The attitude demonstrated is one of respecting differences while refraining from engaging in such practices (Bianda et al., 2026).

Regarding relationships with non-Muslims, the informants stated that social interaction is permitted, including in matters of a secular nature. All three informants emphasized that the boundary of interaction lies in matters of worship and belief, so participating in non-Muslim religious practices is not permitted. When speaking to students, the informants explained that religious differences are a part of social life, and interactions should be conducted with a positive attitude as long as they do not involve matters of faith (Saeed, 2006).

The informants' understanding of religious moderation indicates that moderation is interpreted as a balanced stance neither excessive nor dismissive of religious teachings. The informants stated that religious moderation is important in education to instill attitudes of tolerance and mutual respect, but it must still be grounded in correct religious beliefs. They also emphasized that moderation does not mean justifying all religious teachings, but rather maintaining a balance between faith and social interaction (Qorib & Umiarso, 2025).

In teaching practice, the informants stated that tolerance is taught with an emphasis on religious beliefs and moral values. They teach that Islam is the true religion, while also instilling an attitude of respect for differences and refraining from imposing one's beliefs on others. Additionally, the informants use examples of the Prophet's behavior in social interactions as part of the lesson. Student responses to this material were reported to be quite positive and understandable in the context of daily life (Ardiansyah & Erihadiana, 2022).

In the context of environment and identity, the informants stated that they continue to uphold their religious beliefs while still being able to interact and work professionally within the Muhammadiyah school environment. They have not encountered significant difficulties in adapting and continue to perform their duties in accordance with school policies. The informants also noted that the school environment influences religious practices, particularly in terms of social interaction (Partono et al., 2025).

In addition, the informants' religious understanding stems from the writings of scholars, religious leaders, and religious media considered credible. Their social environment, including schools and communities, is said to influence the informants' religious perspectives, particularly in their daily practices. The informants also acknowledge the influence of certain religious leaders in shaping their understanding, provided that such leaders continue to refer to principles they believe to be valid (Astuti et al., 2025).

*Table 1. Categories of Findings from the Interviews*

No	Topic	Subtopic	Empirical Data (Summary of Informant Responses)
1	Religious understanding	Source of the teachings	Based on the Quran, the Hadith, and the works of Islamic scholars
2	Internal Differences Within Islam	The truth of the school's teachings	Islam is understood as a fixed doctrine based on evidence
		Mazhab	Differences in matters of detail are accepted
3	Relations with Non-Muslims	Local practices	Not followed if there is no evidence
		Social interaction	Permitted in worldly matters
4	Religious moderation	Interaction limits	Not participating in the religious practices of other faiths
		Definition	Moderation as a middle path (tasawuth)
5	Implementation of learning	Moderation limits	Does not violate religious beliefs
		Content	Faith and tolerance are taught together
6	Identity adaptation	Method	The Example of the Prophet Muhammad
		School environment	Remain a member of NU, work at Muhammadiyah

7	Source of understanding	Interaction	Books, religious teachers, media for spreading the message
		References	
		Environment	

## Discussion

The findings of this study indicate that the practice of religious moderation by Islamic Religious Education (IRE) teachers with a Nahdlatul Ulama background in Muhammadiyah-affiliated schools is related to how they interpret Islamic teachings derived from the Qur'an and hadith. These findings can be interpreted within the conceptual framework of *wasathiyah*, namely the principle of balance in religion that positions commitment to religious teachings and social openness as two aspects that go hand in hand. In the study of religious moderation, *wasathiyah* is understood as a middle ground that avoids extremes, whether in the form of rigidity or relativism (Harahap et al., 2023; Pransiska, 2025).

In the context of internal differences within Islam, the data indicate that informants accept differences in matters of *furu'iyah* but remain selective regarding practices not considered to have a strong textual basis. This pattern can be analyzed as a form of conditional tolerance, referred to in the literature as "bounded tolerance." This concept explains that openness to differences remains within certain theological boundaries, thus not undermining commitment to the foundational principles of the faith (Arikarani et al., 2024). Thus, this attitude of both acceptance and limitation indicates a relationship between normative beliefs and social practices in religious life.

Furthermore, regarding relationships with non-Muslims, the research findings indicate a consistent separation between the social sphere and the sphere of religious belief. Social interactions, including cooperation in daily life, are accepted as part of social reality, while aspects of worship and belief are maintained as boundaries that are not crossed. This pattern aligns with a framework of religious moderation that positions tolerance as an attitude of respecting differences without having to adopt the beliefs of others (Harahap et al., 2023). Thus, moderation in this context does not lead to a mixing of teachings, but rather to the clear management of boundaries in social life.

In the field of education, research findings indicate that the value of religious moderation is implemented through the integration of strengthening religious beliefs and fostering attitudes of tolerance in the learning process. This demonstrates that moderation exists not only as a normative concept but also as a pedagogical practice internalized through teacher-student interactions. In Islamic education studies, the teacher's role as an agent of value internalization is a critical factor in shaping students' balanced and contextually appropriate religious attitudes (Wahidah & Kasidi, 2024). Thus, the teaching practices observed among informants reveal a connection between theological and pedagogical dimensions in the implementation of religious moderation.

Furthermore, findings regarding the informants' ability to adapt within the Muhammadiyah school environment indicate the presence of religious identity dynamics within a social context. While their identity as part of the NU tradition is maintained, adjustments occur in their social and professional interactions. This phenomenon can be understood as a form of contextual identity negotiation, in which individuals adjust their social practices without having to change their core beliefs. In recent studies, religious

moderation is understood as a social process formed through interaction, adaptation, and identity negotiation in daily life (Zainuddin et al., 2025).

Based on these overall findings, the practices of religious moderation demonstrated by the informants can be understood as a form of moderation that is contextual and adaptive. The term “adaptive moderation” in this study refers to the interconnection between commitment to religious teachings and the ability to interact within diverse social environments. This concept expands the understanding of religious moderation, which has tended to be positioned as a normative concept, into a tangible and dynamic social practice within the context of education.

## **Conclusion**

This study shows that the practice of religious moderation by Islamic Religious Education teachers with a Nahdlatul Ulama background in Muhammadiyah-affiliated schools cannot be understood in binary terms as either exclusive or inclusive, but rather as a form of “adaptive moderation.” This moderation is reflected in the teachers’ ability to maintain a strong theological commitment grounded in the Qur’an and hadith, while simultaneously demonstrating openness in social interaction and learning. The tolerance exhibited is of a bounded nature, meaning it accepts differences in the social and furu’iyah spheres but maintains boundaries regarding matters of creed and worship. In educational practice, religious moderation is implemented through the integration of doctrinal values and tolerance, so that teachers serve as agents for the internalization of balanced and contextual religious values. Furthermore, the process of adapting and negotiating religious identity demonstrates that religious moderation is a dynamic phenomenon shaped through social interaction within the educational environment.

Academically, this study contributes by introducing the concept of “adaptive moderation” as an extension of research on religious moderation, emphasizing that moderation is not merely normative but also a social practice involving the adaptation and contextualization of religious identity. However, this study has limitations due to the small sample size and its focus on a single educational institution, so the findings cannot be widely generalized. Additionally, this study focuses primarily on the teachers’ perspective and does not yet include the experiences of students or other actors within the school environment.

Based on these findings, it is recommended that the practice of religious moderation in Islamic education continue to be developed through a contextual and adaptive approach, while maintaining a balance between strengthening religious beliefs and fostering tolerance. Educational institutions are expected to provide a space for constructive dialogue among people of various religious backgrounds. For future research, it is recommended to expand the subject and context of the study, including involving students, school principals, or other educational institutions, as well as developing quantitative or mixed-method approaches to measure the effectiveness of adaptive moderation in shaping religious attitudes.

## References

- Archibald, M. M., Ambagtsheer, R. C., Casey, M. G., & Lawless, M. (2019). Using Zoom Videoconferencing for Qualitative Data Collection: Perceptions and Experiences of Researchers and Participants. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 18. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406919874596>
- Ardiansyah, A. A., & Erihadiana, M. (2022). Strengthening Religious Moderation as a Hidden Curriculum in Islamic Religious Universities in Indonesia. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 5(1), 109–122. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v5i1.1965>
- Arikarani, Y., Azman, Z., Aisyah, S., Ansyah, F. P., & Kirti, T. D. Z. (2024). Konsep Pendidikan Islam Dalam Penguatan Moderasi Beragama. *Edification Journal: Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 7(1), 71–88. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.37092/ej.v7i1.840>
- Astuti, A., Mulianingsih, F., Kintoko, K., Purnomo, A., & Saputra, D. (2025). Integration of Religious Moderation in Social Studies Education for Strengthening Disaster Resilience and Sustainable Economic Development in Vulnerable Communities. *EDUPIJ: Educational Process: International Journal*, 20(5), 1–20. <https://www.cceol.com/search/article-detail?id=1389095>
- Bianda, R., Gunaepi, A., Niteh, M. Y., & Ahmad, M. (2026). From Fatwa to Foreign Policy: A Maqāsid al-Sharī'ah Analysis of the 2024 MUI Fatwa on International Relations. *Al-'Adl*, 19(1), 1–18. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.31332/aladl.v19i1.12904>
- Dewantoro, A. Q., Hilmi, M., & Muthi'Uddin, A. (2026). Comparison of Nahdlatul Ulama and Muhammadiyah's Religious Moderation Strategies in the Context of Contemporary Indonesia. *Values: Jurnal Kajian Islam Multidisiplin*, 3(1), 91–102. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.61166/values.v3i1.152>
- Firmansyah, M., Malintang, J., Alfadhli, & Suratin, S. I. (2025). Integrasi Pendidikan Agama Islam dan Hermeneutika Al- Qur'an dalam Ruang Kehidupan. *Raudhah Proud To Be Professionals: Jurnal Tarbiyah Islamiyah*, 10(2), 795–805. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.48094/raudhah.v10i2.952>
- Harahap, E. W., S, S., & Samsudi, W. (2023). Moderasi Beragama dalam Islam. *Edukais: Jurnal Pemikiran Keislaman*, 7(3), 61–80. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.61595/edukais.2023.7.2.61-80>
- John W. Creswell, C. N. P. (2016). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*.
- Keagamaan, B. L. A. dan D. (2019). *Moderasi Beragama*. Badan Litbang dan Diklat, Kementerian Agama RI. [https://books.google.co.id/books/about/Moderasi\\_beragama.html?id=WkcZ0QEA CAAJ&redir\\_esc=y](https://books.google.co.id/books/about/Moderasi_beragama.html?id=WkcZ0QEA CAAJ&redir_esc=y)
- Khasanah, N., Hamzani, A. I., & Aravik, H. (2023). Religious Moderation in the Islamic Education System in Indonesia. *QALAMUNA: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, Dan Agama*, 15(1), 629–642. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.37680/qalamuna.v15i1.4115>
- Meydan, C. H., & Akkaş, H. (2024). *The Role of Triangulation in Qualitative Research: Converging Perspectives*. Ankara Science University. <https://doi.org/10.4018/979-8-3693-3306-8.ch006>

- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2020). *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook*. Sage Publications.
- Nasir, M., & Rijal, M. K. (2021). Keeping The Middle Path: Mainstreaming Religious Moderation Through Islamic Higher Education Institutions in Indonesia. *Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies*, 11(2), 213–241. <https://ijims.iainsalatiga.ac.id/index.php/ijims/article/view/5009>
- Partono, Naja, S., & Amirudin, M. (2025). From Religious Doctrine to Constructive Dialogue: A Phenomenological Analysis of Religious Moderation Practices among NU and Muhammadiyah Students. *Edukasia Islamika: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 10(2), 272–288. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.28918/jei.v10i2.12620>
- Pransiska, S. (2025). Konsep Wasathiyah sebagai Fondasi Moderasi Beragama dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam di Lembaga Pendidikan Tinggi: Studi Literatur. *Nusantara Journal of Multidisciplinary Science*, 3(4), 361–369. <https://jurnal.intekom.id/index.php/njms/article/view/1680>
- Qorib, M., & Umiarso. (2025). The Religious Moderation Model Based on The Unity Of Theo-Socio-Anthropological Values in Muhammadiyah and NU Pesantren in Indonesia. *Cogent Education*, 12(1), 1–14. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2025.2584644>
- Rahiem, M. D. H. (2025). *Towards Resilient Societies: The Synergy of Religion, Education, Health, Science, and Technology: Proceedings of the International Conference on Innovative Interdisciplinary Science for Inclusive and Sustainable Future*. CRC Press. [https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=id&lr=&id=iJZwEQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PA1954&dq=Maila+D.H.+Rahiem,+Religion+and+Education+in+Global+Era+\(CRC+Press,+2025\).&ots=te3DDdHtOs&sig=YwWrjnEaN5RbcwsmP5bgmSqwiOw&redir\\_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Maila D.H. Rahiem%2C Religion and Education in Global Era \(CRC Press%2C 2025\).&f=false](https://books.google.co.id/books?hl=id&lr=&id=iJZwEQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PA1954&dq=Maila+D.H.+Rahiem,+Religion+and+Education+in+Global+Era+(CRC+Press,+2025).&ots=te3DDdHtOs&sig=YwWrjnEaN5RbcwsmP5bgmSqwiOw&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Maila D.H. Rahiem%2C Religion and Education in Global Era (CRC Press%2C 2025).&f=false)
- Saeed, A. (2006). *Islamic Thought: An Introduction*. Routledge. [https://books.google.co.id/books/about/Islamic\\_Thought.html?id=0d1VewAACAAJ&redir\\_esc=y](https://books.google.co.id/books/about/Islamic_Thought.html?id=0d1VewAACAAJ&redir_esc=y)
- Sugiyono. (2020). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D*. Alfabeta.
- Syamsuddin, M., Jannah, K., Indriani, N., Sunandar, A. P., Fathin, M. I., Setiawan, B., & Arpanudin, I. (2025). Religious Moderation Muhammadiyah Inclusivism and Syncretic Islam in Javanese Culture in Yogyakarta. *Civics: Media Kajian Kewarganegaraan*, 22(2), 241–252. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.21831/jc.v22i2.86207>
- Wahidah, N. R., & Kasidi. (2024). Integrasi Nilai-Nilai Moderasi Beragama Dalam Kurikulum Pendidikan Islam di MA Alkhairaat Kota Gorontalo: Kajian Filosofis Dan Pedagogis. *Moderatio: Jurnal Moderasi Beragama*, 4(2), 220–229. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.32332/moderatio.v4i2.9899>
- Zainuddin, Rambe, F. M. R., Sari, R., Basri, & Mulyadi. (2025). Moderasi Beragama: Model Pedagogis Pendidikan Islam di Pondok Pesantren An-Najah. *Ta'diban: Journal of Islamic Education*, 6(1), 81–92. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.61456/tjie.v6i1.305>